

*Ferenc Ruzsa – Mónika Szegedi*

# Vasubandhu's *Vimśikā*

A critical edition

Based on all the known manuscripts, as photographically reproduced in Mimaki et al. (1989), and the editions available to the editors as well as the canonical editions of the Tibetan translation, Vinītadeva's subcommentary, Vairocanarakṣita's gloss and the English translation of Xuanzang's Chinese version.

Insignificant orthographic and sandhi-variants (also trivial typos in the editions) are left unmarked; punctuation marks of the original (*daṇḍas* and *shads*, like | or ||) are not reproduced. Generally a normalized orthography is used. However, absence (or presence) of external sandhi in *ms* is retained, including the use of *m̐ in pausa*.

Punctuation and the vowel sandhi-marker ^ (e.g. *â* for an *ā* resulting from *a+a*) were added.

The questions and arguments of opponents (*pūrva-pakṣa*) are shown in italic.

## Abbreviations

*Sigla:*

- ms** the old manuscript of the Commentary (“B” in Mimaki et al. 1989)  
**msC** the recent copy of *ms* (1–11 of “I” in Mimaki et al. 1989)  
**msK** the manuscript of the Kārikās only (3a4–4a5 of “A” in Mimaki et al. 1989)

- L** the text in Lévi (1925: 1–11)<sup>1</sup>
- L<sup>c</sup>** Lévi’s “Corrections” to the text in Lévi (1932: 175)
- M(B)** the text in Bagchi (1957) as quoted in the apparatus of **M** under the siglum “C”
- M** the text in Tiwary (1967: 1–26)
- A** the text in Anacker (2005: 413–421)
- B** the text in Balcerowicz–Nowakowska (1999)
- F** the text of Fukita (n.d.)
- T** the text in Tola–Dragonetti (2004: 123–153)
- RS** new suggestions by the present editors, F. Ruzsa and M. Szegedi
- mss** all the manuscripts, i.e. *ms* and *msC* (or, in the *kārikās*, *msK*, *ms* and *msC*)
- edd** all the Sanskrit editions considered: **L**, **M**, **A**, **B**, **F** and **T**
- all** all the Sanskrit sources (**mss** and **edd**), except the single one mentioned separately
- Tib.** Tibetan translation of the Commentary in the *Bstan ’gyur* (best reading of the Pedurma, Derge, Cone, Ganden, Peking and Narthang editions)
- Tib.K** Tibetan translation of the *Kārikās* only in the *Bstan ’gyur* (best reading of the Pedurma, Derge, Cone, Ganden, Peking and Narthang editions)
- Ch.** English translation of Xuanzang’s Chinese rendering of the Commentary in Hamilton (1938)
- Vin.** Tibetan translation of Vinītadeva’s subcommentary on the Commentary in the *Bstan ’gyur*, see Dul-ba’i Lha (n.d.)

<sup>1</sup> The text of the *Kārikās* only in Tripathi (1992) and in Wood (1994: 97–102) always follows Lévi, and therefore no separate siglum refers to these editions.

**Vair.** Vairocanarakṣita's gloss (*Viṃśikā-Ṭīkā Vivṛti*) on the Sanskrit original of *Vin.* in Kano (2008: 349–350)

*Other:*

AKB *Abhidharma-kośa Bhāṣya*: Pradhan (1967)

a.c. before correction (*ante correctionem*)

p.c. after correction (*post correctionem*)

om. omitted

cf. compare (*confer*)

v.l. variant reading (*varia lectio*)

Skt. Sanskrit

□ unreadable / broken down syllable (*akṣara*)

◻ unreadable part of an *akṣara*

*italic* signifies doubtful reading when quoting a manuscript

( ) a) when quoting the *Tib.* or *Ch.* text, encloses those words that do not correspond to the Sanskrit word(s) analysed. b) When the meaning of *Tib.* or *Ch.* differs from the Sanskrit, after quoting it a Sanskrit translation is also given in parentheses.

[ ] encloses that part of the main text for which we do not have direct Sanskrit evidence: *ms* or *msK* (or *msC*, where it reports text at a now missing part of *ms*; or, in a few cases, *Vair.*). The editorial suggestions of *msC* (in parentheses, or written above lacunae in smaller script, here marked as *msC p.c.*) do not count as evidence (they are given in the footnotes only).

~~~~ wavy underline shows that part of the text that probably was not part of the original

## Bibliography

- Anacker, Stefan 2005. *Seven Works of Vasubandhu: The Buddhist Psychological Doctor*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass. (Revised Edition, orig. 1984).
- Bagchi, Sitamsu Sekhar 1957. “Vijñaptimātratāsiddhi, Viṃśatikā of Vasubandhu.” In: *Nava-Nālandā-Mahāvihāra Research Publication, vol. I*. Nalanda, 367–389.
- Balcerowicz, Piotr – Monika Nowakowska 1999. “Wasubandhu: Dowód na wyłączne istnienie treści świadomości w dwudziestu strofach (Vasubandhu: Viṃśatikā – Vijñapti-mātratā-siddhi), opracowanie tekstu i przekład z sanskrytu.” *Studia Indologiczne* 6: 5–44.
- Buescher, Hartmut 2002. *The Triṃśikāvijñaptibhāṣya of Sthiramati. Critical Editions of the Sanskrit Text and its Tibetan Translation, Along with an Historical Study: The Inception of Yogācāra-Vijñānavāda*. Ph. D. Dissertation. Copenhagen: University of Copenhagen.
- Dul-ba'i Lha (n.d.) *Rab-tu-byed-pa Nyi-shu-pa'i 'grel-bshad*. (Tibetan trans. of Vinītadeva: *Prakaraṇa-Viṃśaka Ṭīkā*). Derge Tengyur No. 4065 (Sems tsam, vol. shi, 171b7–195b6)
- Fukita, Takamichi (n.d.) *Vasubandhu: Vimsatika vijñaptimatratasiddhi*. (E-text based on Lévi (1925) and Ui (1953).) Göttingen Register of Electronic Texts in Indian Languages.  
[Retrieved on 23.07.2015 from:  
[http://gretil.sub.uni-goettingen.de/gretil/1\\_sanskrit/6\\_sastra/3\\_phil/buddh/vasvmsu.htm](http://gretil.sub.uni-goettingen.de/gretil/1_sanskrit/6_sastra/3_phil/buddh/vasvmsu.htm)]
- Hamilton, Clarence H. 1938. *Wei Shih Er Shih Lun, or The Treatise in Twenty Stanzas on Representation-only by Vasubandhu*, New Haven: American Oriental Society.

- Hanneder, Jürgen 2007. "Vasubandhus *Vimśatikā* 1–2 anhand der Sanskrit- und tibetischen Fassungen." In: Konrad Klaus – Jens-Uwe Hartmann (eds.) *Indica et Tibetica: Festschrift für Michael Hahn zum 65. Geburtstag von Freunden und Schülern überreicht*. (Wiener Studien zur Tibetologie und Buddhismuskunde 66.) Wien: Arbeitskreis für tibetische und buddhistische Studien Universität Wien, 207–214.
- Kano Kazuo 2008. "Two short glosses on Yogācāra texts by Vairocana-rakṣita: *Vimśikāṭīkāvivṛti* and \**Dharmadharmatāvibhāgavivṛti*." In: Francesco Sferra (ed.) *Sanskrit Texts from Giuseppe Tucci's Collection, Part I*. (Manuscripta Buddhica 1.) Roma: Istituto Italiano per l'Africa e l'Oriente, 343–380.
- Kondō, Ryūkō 1936. *Daśabhūmīśvaro nāma Mahāyānasūtram*. Tokyo: The Daijyō Bukkyō Kenyō-Kai.
- Krobath, Florian 2011. *Kritische Edition, Übersetzung und Interpretation des Lta ba'i khyad par von Ye shes sde*. MA thesis, Universität Wien.
- Lévi, Sylvain 1925. *Vijñaptimātratāsiddhi. Deux traités de Vasubandhu: Vimśatikā (La Vingtaine) accompagnée d'une explication en prose et Trīmśikā (La Trentaine) avec le commentaire de Sthiramati. Ire partie. – Texte*. (Bibliothèque de l'École des Hautes Études 245.) Paris: Librairie Ancienne Honoré Champion.
- Lévi, Sylvain 1932. *Matériaux pour l'étude du système Vijñaptimātra*. (Bibliothèque de l'École des Hautes Études 260.) Paris: Librairie Ancienne Honoré Champion.
- Mdo-sde Sa-bcu-pa* 2001. Cazadero: Ye-shes-sde'i Chos-'khor 'Phrul-par Khang.
- Mimaki, Katsumi – Musashi Tachikawa – Akira Yuyama 1989. *Three Works of Vasubandhu in Sanskrit Manuscript: The Trisvabhāvanirdeśa, the Vimśatikā with its Vṛtti, and the Trīmśikā with Sthiramati's Commentary*. (Bibliotheca Codicum Asiaticorum 1.) Tokyo: The Centre for East Asian Cultural Studies.

- Pradhan, P. 1967. *Abhidharm-Koshabhāṣya of Vasubandhu*. Patna: K. P. Jayaswal Research Institute.
- Suali, Luigi 1905. “Il »Lokatattvanirṇaya« di Haribhadra.” *Giornale della Società Asiatica Italiana XVIII*, pp. 263–319.
- Tiworthy, Mahesh 1967. *Vijñaptimātratāsiddhi of Vasubandhu (Viṃśatikā with the auto Sub-Commentary, Trīmśikā Kārikā with the Commentary of Sthiramati together with Hindi Translation)*. (Vidyabhawan Sanskrit Granthamala 139.) Varanasi: The Chowkhamba Vidyabhawan.
- Tola, Fernando – Carmen Dragonetti 2004. *Being as Consciousness: Yogācāra Philosophy of Buddhism*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.
- Tripathi, Ram Shankar 1992. *Vijñaptimatratāsiddhi prakarana dvayam*. Varanasi: Sampurnananda Sanskrit University.  
E-text of the Kārikās only reproduced on the Digital Sanskrit Buddhist Canon website. [Retrieved on 25.07.2015 from <http://www.dsb-cproject.org/vimśatikākārikā/vimśatikākārikā>]
- Ui, Hakuju 字井伯寿 1953. *Shiyaku-taisyō Yuisiki nijū-ron kenkyū* 四譯對照唯識二十論研究 (Daijō-bukkyō Kenkyū 4) [\*Comparative Study of the Viṃśatikā vijñaptimātratāsiddhi with Four Translations (Studies of the Mahāyāna Buddhism, 4)], Tokyo, pp. 20–21.
- de la Vallée Poussin, Louis 1912. “Vasubandhu: Viṃśakakārikāprakaraṇa. Traité des vingt śloka, avec la commentaire de l’auteur. Traduction tibétaine et traduction française.” *Le Muséon, Nouvelle série XIII*: 53–90.
- Wayman, Alex 1984. *Buddhist Insight: Essays*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.
- Wood, Thomas E. 1994. *Mind Only: A Philosophical and Doctrinal Analysis of the Vijñānavāda*. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass. (Repr. 1999; originally University of Hawaii Press, 1991.)

Ye Shaoyong 2005. *Akṣara List of the Manuscript of the Saddharma-puṇḍarīkasūtra (1082 CE, Collection of Sanskrit Mss. Formerly Preserved in the China Ethnic Library)*. Research Institute of Sanskrit Manuscripts&Buddhist Literature, Peking University.  
[Retrieved on 31.10.2015 from: <http://www.mldc.cn/sanskritweb/resour/pale/saddharma.pdf>]

Vasubandhu:

## Vimśatikā Vijñapti-mātratā-siddhiḥ

### 1.<sup>2,3</sup> Vijñapti-mātram evēdam,<sup>4</sup> asad-arthāvabhāsanāt; yadvat<sup>5</sup> taimirikasyāsat<sup>6</sup>-keśoṅḍukādi<sup>7</sup>-darśanam.

<sup>2</sup> The first page of *ms* is missing. Till the end of the Commentary ad 2 the Sanskrit text was reconstructed from *Tib.* and *Ch.*, utilising the material of *msK* and *Vair*. On certain points we asked Gábor Kósa about the earlier Chinese translations, all the information about Prajñāru-ci's and Paramārtha's translation is based on his expertise. – *msK* starts with the invocation, Namaḥ Sarva-jñāya!

<sup>3</sup> *Kārikā 1* is not quoted in the Commentary (neither in *Tib.*, nor in *Ch.*), only its paraphrase is given in the second paragraph (Vijñānam idam...). That it must have been part of the original is clearly shown by the Commentary twice quoting vijñapti-mātram evēdam (before verses 19 and 21). Further it is present in Paramārtha's Chinese translation; and also in Prajñāru-ci's kārikās-only translation, while in the Commentary he twice quotes from the verse verbatim. The omission is probably due to an early Sanskrit editorial oversight. In our reconstruction, the paraphrase is almost a śloka, especially if we suppose that the word for fly/gnat was not maśaka, but a disyllabic like daśā, kīṭa, kaṇā, kṣudrā, bhambha, makṣā, moṇa or nīlā (*Vin.* 's three referen-ces suggest that he read skra dang sha sbrang la sogs pa, i.e. keśa-damśādi, see fn. 14):

Vijñānam idam evārtha-pratibhāsenōtpadyate,  
yathā taimirikair asat keśa-damśādi dṛṣyate.

So the early Sanskrit editor may have thought that this is the first *Kārikā* as the Commentator knew it.

Lévi also decided to take the prose of the *Tib.* and *Ch.* versions as representing *Kārikā 1*, and instead of translating the text of the Commentary (second paragraph) he inserted there a version of *Kārikā 1*. First he started from Louis de la Vallée Poussin's text:

vijñapti-mātram evāitad, asad-arthāvabhāsanāt  
yathā taimirikasyāsat-keśa-kīṭādi-darśanam

Although Poussin clearly remarked that “kīṭa étaît préférable à candra” (de la Vallée Poussin 1912: 67–68), Lévi – following *Tib.* – replaced it with candra in *L*. In *L* he substituted for the whole verse *msK*'s text. All the later editions followed him, either the version of *L* or of *L*.

Poussin's source was a quotation in the Lokatattvanirṇaya of Haribhadra (verse 74), as printed in Suali (1905: 283–284):

vijñapti-mātram evāitad, asamarthāvabhāsanāt  
yathā taimirikasyēha kośa-kīṭādi-darśanam

Poussin emended it convincingly as seen above.

<sup>4</sup> evēdam *msK*, *L*, *M*, *A*, *F*, *T*; evāitad *L*, *B*; *Tib.K* 'di dag... nyid (but the plural here does not reflect a Sanskrit plural, since the identical sentence in the prose introduction to *Kārikā 19* & *21* is again translated as “'di dag rnam par rig pa tsam du zad”

<sup>5</sup> yadvat *msK*, *L*, *M*, *A*, *F*, *T*; yathā *L*, *B*, *Tib.K* dper na... bzhin

<sup>6</sup> taimirikasyā° *msK*; taimirikasyā *all*; *Tib.K* rab rib can dag gis (taimirikānām a°) (but Ye-she-sde in his prose paraphrase uses the singular rab rib can gyis – Krobath 2011: 32. Similarly *Sthiramati*: taimirikasya / rab rib can gyis – Buescher 2002: \*3, \*\*3)

<sup>7</sup> keśoṅḍukādi *msK*; keśoṅḍukādi *F*, *T* (also Ye-she-sde in his prose paraphrase: skra shad 'dzings pa la sogs pa – Krobath 2011: 32. Similarly *Sthiramati*: keśoṅḍukādi / skra shad 'dzings pa la sogs pa – Buescher 2002: \*3, \*\*3); keśoṅḍrakādi *L*, *M*, *A*; keśa-candrādi *L*, *B*, *Tib.K* skra zla la sogs, also Prajñāru-ci: hair, moon etc.; cf. Mokṣopāya 6.284.2: yathā taimirikākṣāṇām keśa-candrādi-darśanam (Hanneder 2007: 211, 213); Paramārtha: hair, two moons, etc. The text known to the Commentator and also to *Vin.* must have been keśa-damśādi or keśa-kīṭādi, see fn. 3 and 14.



Mahāyāne traidhātukam<sup>8</sup> [vijñapti-mātratayā vyavasthāpitam:<sup>9</sup> “Bho jina-putrāḥ, evaṃ bhavati – citta-mātram idaṃ, yad idaṃ traidhātukam”<sup>10</sup> iti sūtrāt.<sup>11</sup> *Cittam, mano, vijñānam, vijñaptir* iti paryāyāḥ.<sup>12</sup> Tac ca cittam atra sa-saṃprayogam abhipretam – “mātram” ity artha-pratiṣedhārtham uktam.<sup>13</sup>

<sup>8</sup> mahāyāne traidhātukam *Vair*. (agrees with *L*'s reconstruction and therefore with *edd*)

<sup>9</sup> Mahāyāne... vyavasthāpitam *RS, Tib.* theg pa chen po la khams gsum pa rnam par rig pa tsam du rnam par bzhaḡ (v.l., also *Vin.* gzhag) ste, *Ch.* In the Mahāyāna it is established that the three worlds are representation only; ...-mātram vyavasthāpyate *edd*

<sup>10</sup> Bho... traidhātukam *RS, Tib.* kye rgyal ba'i sras dag, 'di lta ste – khams gsum pa 'di ni sems tsam mo; citta-mātram, bho jina-putrā, yad uta trai-dhātukam *edd*, *Paramārtha* similarly has the address “*Buddha's sons*”; *Ch.* the three worlds are only mind, *Prajñāruci* similarly; *Vin. om.* 'di lta ste (evaṃ bhavati).

*It seems to be a quotation from the 6<sup>th</sup> chapter of the Daśa-bhūmika Sūtra: “Tasyāivaṃ bhavati: citta-mātram idaṃ, yad idaṃ traidhātukam.” (Kondō 1936: 98) The address bho jina-putrāḥ is very frequent in the text as we have it, occurring 34 times, but only from the 7<sup>th</sup> chapter on. The singular form, bho jina-putra, occurs 9 times, all in the first chapter.*

*The Tibetan translation of the Sūtra is: “de 'di snyam du sems te: 'di lta khams gsum pa 'di ni sems tsam ste.” (Mdo-sde Sa-bcu-pa 2001: 238). Ye-shes-sde, however, quotes the Daśabhūmika Sūtra as “kye rgyal ba'i sras khams gsum 'di ni sems tsam mo” (i.e. starting with bho jina-putra), and again without the address; and in a third place he attributes the (longer) text to the Lokottara-parivarta (Krobath 2011: 32, 36, 34).*

<sup>11</sup> iti sūtrāt *edd, Tib.* mdo las... zhes 'byung ba'i phyir ro, *Ch.* According to the scriptures it is said that

<sup>12</sup> Cittam... paryāyāḥ *RS, Tib.* sems dang yid dang rnam par shes pa dang rnam par rig pa zhes bya ba ni rnam grangs su gtogs pa'o, *Ch.* Mind, thought, consciousness, discernment are different names; ... vijñaptis cēti paryāyāḥ *edd*

<sup>13</sup> Tac ca... uktam *RS, Tib.* sems de yang 'dir mtshungs par ldan pa dang bcas par dgongs pa'o. tsam zhes bya ba smos pa ni don dgag pa'i phyir ro, *Ch.* What is here spoken of as mind includes mental activities also in its meaning. “Only” excludes external objects; it does not do away with mental associates; *edd. om.* tac ca and uktam

Vijñānam idam evārtha-pratibhāsenôtpadyate, yathā taimirikair asat keśa-maśakâdi<sup>14</sup> dr̥ṣyate:<sup>15</sup>] nārthaḥ kaścīd asti.<sup>16</sup>

[Idam atra paryanuyujyate:<sup>17</sup>]

2. – *Na deśa-kāla-niyamaḥ, samtānā-niyamo na ca, na ca kṛtya-kriyā yuktā – vijñaptir yadi nārthataḥ.*<sup>18</sup>

<sup>14</sup> keśa-maśakâdi **RS, Ch.** *hairs and flies*, **Vin.** *skra dang sha sbrang dang sbrang bu la sogs pa* (keśa-damśa-maśakâdi), cf. the Commentary ad 2: *skra dang sbrang bu la sogs pas* (keśa-maśakâdikam), cf. **Vin.** in the Commentary ad 2: *skra dang sbrang bu dang sha sbrang la sogs pas* (keśa-maśaka-damśâdikam), cf. **Vin.** in the Commentary ad 4a: *skra dang sha sbrang* (keśa-damśa-); **Tib.** *skra zla la sogs pa* (keśa-candrâdi); **Prajñāruci:** “hair or flame, second moon up to the city of the gandharvas in a dream as an illusion”; **Paramārtha:** “two moons or deer-thirst” [= mirage]. See also fn. 7. **AKB** (3.8cd, p.118) translates *kṛmi-kīṭa-pataṅga-maśaka srin bu dang sbur pa dang phye ma leb dang sbrang bu*. *Sbrang bu* in two other places (1.44 ab, p.33 and 4.103d, p.263) also corresponds to *maśaka*, while at 2.46cd (p.80) to *makṣikā* and at 4.68d (p.240) to *tryambuka*.

<sup>15</sup> Vijñānam...dr̥ṣyate **RS, Tib.** *rnam par shes pa 'di nyid don du snang ba 'byung ste, dper na rab rib can rnam kyis skra zla la sogs pa med par mthong ba bzhin te*, **Ch.** *When inner representations arise, seemingly external objects appear; as [persons] having bad eyes see hairs and flies; om. edd, adding the text of Kārikā 1 here (see fn. 3)*

<sup>16</sup> nārthaḥ kaścīd asti **Vair., Tib.** *don gang yang med do*, **Vin.** *don (sngon po la sogs pa gud na) gang yang med do (zhes bya ba ni mjug bsdu ba'o)* (na (vibhinno nīlādy-)arthāḥ kaścīd astī (ty upasamharati)), **Ch.** [But] herein is no particle of truth; kaścīd artho nāsti **M**, also in **F** after the next sentence (see fn.17); om. **L, A, B, F, T** *Lévi's omission is difficult to explain since the sentence is clearly present in Poussin's edition and also his translation: “il n'y a aucun objet” (de la Vallée Poussin 1912: 67).*

<sup>17</sup> Idam atra paryanuyujyate **RS, Tib.** *'dir 'di skad ces brgal te*, **Ch.** *To this doctrine there are supposed objections; atra codyate edd; F also adds kaścīd artho nāsti (misplaced, should have come before this sentence).* – Paryanuyujyate highly conjectural for “brgal”, based on *paudgalikas tu paryanuyojyaḥ* (**AKB Ch.** 9, p. 471), **Tib.** translation: *gang zag pa rnam la brgal zhing brtag par bya ste.*

<sup>18</sup> **msK, L, M, A, F, T;** [Yadi vijñaptir anarthā: niyamo deśa-kālayoḥ, / santānasyāniyamāś ca, yuktā kṛtya-kriyā na ca.] **L, B, Tib.** *gal te rnam rig don min na / yul dang dus la nges med cing / sems kyang nges med ma yin la / bya ba byed pa'ang mi rigs 'gyur /*, **Ch.** *If representations are without real objects, / Then their spatial and temporal determination, / The indetermination of the [perceiving] stream of consciousness, / And their action, must be unfounded.*

[*Kim uktaṃ bhavati?*<sup>19</sup>

*Yady asati rūpâdy-arthe rūpâdi-vijñaptir utpadyate, na rūpâdy-arthāt – kasmāt kvacid eva deśa<sup>20</sup> utpadyate, na sarvatra?<sup>21</sup> Tatrâiva ca deśe kadācid utpadyate, na sarvadā?<sup>22</sup> Tasmin deśa-kāle sthitānām sarveṣām saṃtāne 'niyamam<sup>23</sup> utpadyate, nâikasyâiva?<sup>24</sup> Yathā taimirakasyâiva saṃtāne keśādikaṃ pratibhāsate, nānyeṣām!<sup>25</sup>*

<sup>19</sup> Kim uktaṃ bhavati **edd, Tib.** *ji skad du bstan par 'gyur zhe na, Ch.* *What does this mean?*

<sup>20</sup> kvacid eva deśa **RS, Tib.** *yul la lar, cf. the Commentary ad 3a: yul la la na (kvacid eva deśe); kvacid deśa edd, Ch. in a certain place*

<sup>21</sup> Yady... sarvatra **RS, Tib.** *gal te gzugs la sogs pa'i don med par gzugs la sogs pa'i rnam par rig pa 'byung ste, gzugs la sogs pa'i don las ma yin na – ci'i phyir yul la lar 'byung la (v.l. ba), thams cad na ma yin?, Ch.* *If we abandon [the notion] that representations have colored etc. outer objects, then when a sense representation arises it does not correspond to a sense object. Why (then) does this representation arise in a certain place, not in all places?; yadi vinā (vināpi **M**) rūpâdy-arthena rūpâdi-vijñaptir utpadyate, na rūpâdy-arthāt – kasmāt kvacid deśa utpadyate, na sarvatra? **edd***

<sup>22</sup> Tatrâiva... sarvadā **edd, Tib.** *yul de nyid na yang res 'ga' 'byung la (v.l. ba) thams cad du ma yin, Ch.* *Why, in this place, does the representation arise at a certain time, not at all times?*

<sup>23</sup> saṃtāne 'niyamam **RS, Vin.** *sems (rnams) la... nges pa med par, Tib.* *sems la nges pa med pa, Ch.* *and Paramārtha seem to reflect this reading, both have “not determined”; saṃtānāniyama **M(B), F**; saṃtāna **L, M, A, B, T***

<sup>24</sup> Tasmin... nâikasyâiva **RS, Tib.** *yul dang dus de na 'khod pa thams cad kyi sems la nges pa med pa 'byung la 'ga' tsam la ma yin, Ch.* *When many streams of consciousness are together at one time and place why is the representation not determined to arise according to one of them; Tad-deśa-kāla-pratiṣṭhitānām sarveṣām saṃtāna (v.l. see fn. 23) utpadyate, na kevalam ekasya **edd***

<sup>25</sup> Yathā... nānyeṣām **RS, Tib.** *ji ltar rab rib can nyid kyi sems la skra la sogs pa snang gi, gchan dag la ni ma yin; Ch.* *just as a person with defective eyes sees hairs and flies while those with good eyesight do not have these representations arise?; yathā taimirikāṇām saṃtāne keśādy-ābhāso (-ābhāsām **B**) nānyeṣām **edd**; Prajñārucci has “sun, moon, hair, wheel, fly etc.”; Paramārtha has “hair, two moons etc.”*

*Kasmāt keśādi-kriyām na karoti yat keśa-maśakādikaṃ taimirikeṇa dṛṣṭam; tad-anyāni ca kurvanti?*<sup>26</sup> *Svapna-dṛṣṭam ādya-peya-vastra-viśa-śastrādikam anna-pānādi-kriyām na karoti, tad-anyāni ca kurvanti?*<sup>27</sup> *Gandharva-nagaram abhūtaṃ nagara-kriyām na karoti, tad-anyāni ca kurvanti?*<sup>28</sup>

*Asaty artha eteṣām asatām iva*<sup>29</sup> *deśa-kāla*<sup>30</sup> *niyamah, samtānāniyamah,*<sup>31</sup> *kṛtya-kriyā ca na yujyate.*

— Na khalu na yujyate! Yasmāt

<sup>26</sup> Kasmāt... kurvanti **RS, Tib.** *ci'i phyir gang rab rib can gyis mthong ba'i skra dang sbrang bu la sogs pas skra la sogs pa'i bya ba mi byed la; de ma yin pa gzhan dag gis ni byed?*; Kasmād yat (yat om. **M**) taimirikaiḥ keśa-bhramarādi dṛśyate, tena keśādi-kriyā na kriyate; na ca tad-anyair na kriyate **edd; Ch.** *Again, why is it that the hairs etc. seen by persons with defective eyes do not function as hairs etc.?*; Prajñārucci: “Sun, moon, hair, wheel, fly seen by a man with a cataract in the eye does not function as such, while things seen by a man with clear eyes do so”; Paramārtha: “Further why is it that the hair, fly or other illusion seen by a man with a cataract in the eye cannot produce the real effects of a hair or a fly etc., while real things can produce these?”

<sup>27</sup> Svapna-dṛṣṭam... kurvanti **RS, Tib.** *rmi lam na mthong ba'i bza' ba dang btung ba dang bgo ba dang dug dang mtshon la sogs pas zas dang skom la sogs pa'i bya ba mi byed la; de ma yin pa gzhan dag gis ni byed; Yad anna-pāna-vastra-viśayudhādi svapne dṛśyate, tenānādi-kriyā na kriyate; na ca tad-anyair na kriyate **edd; Ch.** *In a dream what drink, food, knives, cudgels, poison, medicines, clothes etc. are obtained are without the functions of drink etc.*; Prajñārucci: “Drink, food, hunger, satiety, knife, staff, poison and the like seen in a dream do not function as such, while drink, food, hunger, satiety, knife, staff, poison and the like seen while awake all do so”; Paramārtha: “Further drink, food, clothes, poison, knife, staff obtained in a dream cannot produce the effects related to them, while other things can.”*

<sup>28</sup> Gandharva-nagaraṃ... kurvanti **RS, Tib., Vin.** *dri za'i grong khyer yod pa ma yin pas grong khyer gyi bya ba mi byed la; de ma yin pa gzhan dag gis ni byed, Prajñārucci:* “The city of the gandharvas does not really exist and does not function as a city; other cities really exist and function as cities”, Paramārtha: “Further the city of the gandharvas does not exist in reality, so cannot produce the effects of a city, but other cities can produce them”; gandharva-nagareṇāsattvān nagara-kriyā na kriyate; na ca tad-anyair na kriyate **edd; Ch.** *A city of the Gandharvas cannot be used as a city. But other hair and things [of ordinary waking experience] are not without use.*

<sup>29</sup> asaty artha eteṣām asatām iva **RS, Tib.** *'di dag don med par med du 'dra na; Ch.* *If they [i.e. dream and waking] are truly the same in having no outer sense objects and there is only an appearance of external objects arising in consciousness; Paramārtha:* “If they are the same in having no material (object)”; tasmād arthābhāve **L, M, B, T;** tasmād asad-bhāvābhāsane **M(B);** tasmād asad yad abhāvanābhāsane **A;** tasmād asad-abhāvābhāsane **F**

<sup>30</sup> deśa-kāla **edd, Tib.** *yul dang dus, Ch.* *in space,... in time. — Here ends the reconstructed first page.*

<sup>31</sup> samtānāniyamah **all;** santānān niyamah **ms**

### 3. Deśādi-niyamaḥ siddhaḥ, svapnavat.

Svapna iva svapnavat. Kathaṁ tāvat? Svapne vināpy arthena kvacid eva deśe kiṁcid [grām]ârāma<sup>32</sup>-strī-puruṣādikaṁ dṛśyate, na sarvatra. Tatrāiva ca deśe kadācid dṛśyate, na sarva-kālam – iti siddho<sup>33</sup> vināpy arthena deśa-kāla<sup>34</sup>-niyamah.

#### Pretavat punaḥ

#### saṁtānāniyamah,

...siddha iti vartate. Pretānām iva pretavat. Kathaṁ siddhaḥ? Samaṁ<sup>35</sup>

#### ...sarvaiḥ pūya-nady-ādi-darśane.

Pūya-pūrṇā nadī pūya-nadī, *ghṛta-ghaṭavat*. Tulya-karma-vipākāvasthā hi pretāḥ sarve 'pi samaṁ<sup>36</sup> pūya-pūrṇām<sup>37</sup> nadīm paśyanti, nāika eva. Yathā pūya-pūrṇām, evaṁ mūtra-purīṣādi<sup>38</sup>-pūrṇām; daṇḍāsi-dharaiś ca puruṣair adhiṣṭhitām – ity ādi-grahaṇena. Evaṁ saṁtānāniyamā vijñaptīnām asaty apy arthe siddhaḥ.

### 4. Svapnôpaghâtavat kṛtya-kriyā.

...siddhêti<sup>39</sup> veditavyam. Yathā svapne dvaya-samāpattim antareṇa<sup>40</sup> śukra-visarga-lakṣaṇaḥ svapnôpaghâtaḥ.<sup>41</sup> Evaṁ tāvad anyān[y]air<sup>42</sup> dṛṣṭāntair deśa-kāla-niyamādi catuṣṭayam siddham.

<sup>32</sup> grāmârāma **RS, Tib. and Vin.** *grong dang kun dga' ra ba, Ch.* a village, a garden; bhramarârāma **all**

<sup>33</sup> siddho **all; Ch.** not unfounded (nāsiddho)

<sup>34</sup> deśa-kāla **all, Vin.** *yul dang dus, Ch.* spatial and temporal; **Tib.** *yul la sogs pa* (deśādi)

<sup>35</sup> samaṁ **all, Ch.** (the ghosts...) Together (behold) the same (river); om. **Tib., Vin.**

<sup>36</sup> samaṁ **ms, B, Tib.** *mtshungs par, Vin.* 'dra bar, **Ch.** (assemble) together; om. **msC, L, M, A, F, T**

<sup>37</sup> pūrṇām **all; pūrṇan ms a.c.**

<sup>38</sup> mūtra-purīṣādi **all; Tib.** *gcin dang ngan skyugs dang me ma mur dang mchil ma dang snabs kyis* (mūtra-vāntāngāra-lālā-siṅghāṇa); **Vin.** *gcin gyis (gang ba dang...)* ngan skyugs kyis (gang ba) (mūtra-vānta); **Ch.** *ordure etc.* (purīṣādi)

<sup>39</sup> siddhêti **mss, L, M, B, T;** siddha iti **A, F**

<sup>40</sup> dvaya-samāpattim antareṇa **all; Ch.** *although the objects are unreal* (asatsv apy artheṣu)

<sup>41</sup> svapnôpaghâtaḥ **all, Tib.** *rmi lam gyi gnod pa'o;* **Ch.** *as in dream... the loss (of semen); RS perhaps for svapnôpaghrâtaḥ?*

<sup>42</sup> anyānyair **all, Tib.** (dpe) *gzhan dang gzhan dag gis, Ch.* diverse; anyānyair **ms**

## Narakavat punaḥ

sarvaṃ,

siddham iti veditavyam. Narakeṣv iva narakavat. Kathaṃ siddham?

### ...naraka-pālādi-darśane taiś ca bādthane.

Yathā hi narakeṣu nārakāṇām<sup>43</sup> naraka-pālādi-darśanaṃ deśa-kāla-niyamena siddham. Śva-vāyasāyasa-parvatādy-āgamana-gamana-darśanaṃ cēty ādi-grahaṇena. Sarveṣāṃ ca nāikasyāiva. Taiś ca tad-bādhanam siddham, asatsv api<sup>44</sup> naraka-pālādiṣu; samāna-sva-karma-vipākādhipatyāt. Tathānyatrāpi sarvaṃ etad deśa-kāla-niyamādi catuṣṭayaṃ siddham iti veditavyam.

— *Kim punaḥ kāraṇam, naraka-pālās te ca śvāno vāyasāś<sup>45</sup> ca sattvā nēṣyante?*

— Ayogāt:

(a) Na hi te nārakā yujyante, tathāiva tad-duḥkhâpratisamvedanāt. Parasparaṃ yātayatām „ime nārakā”, „ime naraka-pālā” iti vyavasthā na syāt. Tulyâkṛti-pramāṇa-balānām ca parasparaṃ yātayatām [api]<sup>46</sup> na tathā bhayaṃ syāt. Dāha-duḥkham ca pradīptāyām ayo-mayyām bhūmāv a-sahamānāḥ, kathaṃ tatra parān yātayeyuḥ?

(b) A-nārakāṇām vā<sup>47</sup> narake<sup>48</sup> kutaḥ sambhavaḥ?

— *Kathaṃ tāvat tiraścām svarge<sup>49</sup> sambhavaḥ? Evaṃ narakeṣu<sup>50</sup> tiryak-preta-višeṣāṇām naraka-pālādīnām sambhavaḥ syāt.*

<sup>43</sup> nārakāṇām *all*; nārakānām *ms a.c.*

<sup>44</sup> asatsv api *all*; *Tib. dngos po la... med par yang, Ch. although (in hell) there are no really actual (tattvataḥ asatsv api)*

<sup>45</sup> te ca śvāno vāyasāś ca *all*; *Tib. dang bya rog dang khyi la sogs pa de dag (te ca vāyasa-śvādayaḥ); Ch. etc. (-ādayaḥ)*

<sup>46</sup> api *RS, Tib. and Vin. kyang; om. all*

<sup>47</sup> vā *all*; *om. Tib., Ch.*

<sup>48</sup> narake *edd, ms p.c., msC p.c.; nārake ms a.c., msC a.c.*

<sup>49</sup> svarge *ms, msC a.c., B; svarga- msC p.c., L, M, A, F, T*

<sup>50</sup> *Tib., Vin. adds yang (api), Ch. likewise (probably translates evaṃ... api)*

**5. — Tiraścām sambhavaḥ svarge yathā, na<sup>51</sup> narake<sup>52</sup> tathā;  
na pretānām<sup>53</sup> – yatas<sup>54</sup> taj-jaṃ duḥkhaṃ nānubhavanti te.**

Ye hi tiryāñcaḥ svarge sambhavanti, te (tad-bhājana-loka-sukha-saṃvar-tanīyena<sup>55</sup> karmaṇā tatra sambhūtās) taj-jaṃ sukhaṃ pratyanubhavanti. Na cāivaṃ<sup>56</sup> naraka-pālādayo nārakaṃ duḥkhaṃ pratyanubhavanti; tasmān na [tatra]<sup>57</sup> tiraścām sambhavo yukto, nāpi pretānām.<sup>58</sup>

— *Teṣām tarhi nārakāṇām karmabhis tatra bhūta-viśeṣāḥ sambhavanti, varṇākṛti-pramāṇa-bala-viśiṣṭā yena<sup>59</sup> naraka-pālādi-saṃjñām pratilabhante. Tathā ca pariṇamanti, yad vividhām<sup>60</sup> hasta-vikṣepādi-kriyām kurvanto dṛśyante, bhayōtpādanārthaṃ. Yathā meṣākṛtayaḥ parvatā āga[ccha]nto–gacchanta[h; ayaḥ-śālmālī-]vane<sup>61</sup> ca kaṇṭakā adho-mukhī-bhavanta–ūrddhva-mukhī-bhavantaś cēti. Na te na sambhavanty eva!*

**6. — Yadi tat-karmabhis tatra bhūtānām sambhavas tathā,  
iṣyate<sup>62</sup> pariṇāmaś ca – kim vijñānasya nēṣyate<sup>63</sup>?**

Vijñānasyāiva<sup>64</sup> tat-karmabhis<sup>65</sup> tathā pariṇāmaḥ kasmān nēṣyate, kim punar bhūtāni kalpyante?

<sup>51</sup> na *ms, msC a.c., Vair., L, M, B, F, Tib. min, Vin. mi (rigs)* (na (yuktaḥ)), *Ch. not*; ca *msK, msC p.c., L, A, T*

<sup>52</sup> narake *all, Vair.; Tib. dmyal ba, Vin. sems can dmyal ba pa, Ch. those in hell* (nārakās)

<sup>53</sup> na pretānām *all*; pretānām ca v.l. according to *Vair.*

<sup>54</sup> yatas *all, Tib.K 'di lta bur, Ch. for; Tib. de lta bur* (tatas)

<sup>55</sup> saṃvartanīyena *all*; saṃvarttayena *ms a.c.* (nī added in the margin below by a different hand)

<sup>56</sup> cāivaṃ *all, Tib. de bzhin du, Ch. so*; cāiva *F*

<sup>57</sup> tatra *RS, Tib., Vin. der, Ch. in hell; om. all*

<sup>58</sup> pretānām *all, Vin. yi dags rnams, Ch. those belonging to the... ghost abode; Tib. yi dvags kyi bye brag dag* (preta-viśeṣāṇām)

<sup>59</sup> yena *ms, Tib., Vin. gang gis*; ye na *B*; ye *msC, L, M, A, F, T, Ch. which*

<sup>60</sup> vividhām *all, Tib. sna tshogs, Ch. all kinds of*; dvividhām *F*

<sup>61</sup> āgacchanta gacchantaḥ ayaḥ-śālmālī-vane *edd* (with °nto 'yaḥ for °ntaḥ ayaḥ in *L, A, B, F, T*), *Tib., Vin. 'ong ba dang 'gro ba dang lcags kyi shal ma li'i nags tshal* (*Vin. adds la*), *Ch. separating and coming together... of the steel forest*; āgantogacchanta □□□□□□ vane *ms*; āga(ccha)nto gacchanta □□□□□□ vane *msC*

<sup>62</sup> iṣyate *all, Tib.K, Vin. 'dod, Ch. if you grant; Tib. 'dug* (vartate)

<sup>63</sup> nēṣyate *all, Tib. mi 'dod, Ch. not admit*; neṣy□ *ms*

<sup>64</sup> vijñānasyāiva *all, Tib. rnam par shes pa nyid, Ch. consciousness*; □jñānasyāiva *ms*

<sup>65</sup> *Tib.* (but not *Vin.*) *adds der* (tatra) (as in the *kārikā*)

Api ca:<sup>66</sup>

**7. Karmaṇo vāsanānyatra,<sup>67</sup> phalam anyatra kalpyate.  
Tatrâiva nêṣyate,<sup>68</sup> yatra vāsanā – kim nu<sup>69</sup> kâraṇam?**

Yena hi karmaṇā narakāṇām tatra tādṛṣo bhūtānām sambhavaḥ kalpyate, pariṇāmas ca: tasya<sup>70</sup> karmaṇo vāsanā teṣāṃ vijñāna-[saṃtāne]<sup>71</sup> saṃniviṣṭā, nānyatra! Yatrâiva ca vāsanā, tatrâiva tasyāḥ phalam (tādṛṣo vijñāna-pariṇāmaḥ) kim nêṣyate? Yatra vāsanā nâsti, tatra tasyāḥ phalam kalpyata – iti kim atra kâraṇam?

— Āgamaḥ kâraṇam. Yadi vijñānam eva rūpâdi-pratibhāsam syān, na rūpâdiko 'rthas, tadā rūpâdy-āyatanâstivam Bhagavatā nôktaṃ syāt!

— Akâraṇam etat; yasmāt

**8. Rūpâdy-āyatanâstivam tad-vineya-janam prati  
abhiprâya-vaśād uktam, upapâduka-sattvavat.**

Yathâsti sattva upapâduka ity uktam Bhagavatā,<sup>72</sup> abhiprâya-vaśāc – citta-saṃtaty-anucchedam āyatyām abhipretya;

<sup>66</sup> api ca *all, Ch. and again; om. Tib.*

<sup>67</sup> vāsanānyatra *all*; vāsavānyatra (?) *ms*

<sup>68</sup> nêṣyate *all, Tib.* 'dod mi bya, *Ch.* you deny; □e□□ *ms*

<sup>69</sup> nu *all*; na *msC p.c.*

<sup>70</sup> tasya *all, Tib. de'i, Ch. of those; om. L*

<sup>71</sup> saṃtāne *RS, Tib. rgyud la, Ch. in the continuity; saṃtāna- edd; □□□ mss*

<sup>72</sup> *AKB Ch. 9, p. 468*: Asty eva pudgalo, yasmād uktam: “nâsti sattva upapâduka iti mithyâ-dṛṣṭiḥ”. Kaś cāivam āha, nâsti sattva upapâduka iti? Sattvas tu yathā 'sti, tathā vibhaktô Bhagavatêti brūmo Mānuṣyaka-sūtre.



„Nâstîha sattva, ātmā vā. Dharmās tv ete sa-hetukāḥ”<sup>73</sup>  
 iti vacanāt. Evaṃ rūpâdy-āyatanâstivam apy uktam Bhagavatā, tad-deśanā-  
 vineya-janam adhikṛtyēty ābhiprāyikaṃ tad vacanam.

— *Ko 'rābhiprāyaḥ?*

**9. — Yataḥ sva-bijād vijñaptir yad-ābhāsā pravartate,  
 dvidividhāyatanatvena<sup>74</sup> te tasyā munir abravīt.**

Kim<sup>75</sup> uktam bhavati?

Rūpa-pratibhāsā<sup>76</sup> vijñaptir yataḥ sva-bijāt pariṇāma-viśeṣa-prāptād ut-  
 padyate; tac ca bijam yat-pratibhāsā ca sā = te, tasyā vijñapteś<sup>77</sup> cakṣū-  
 rūpāyatanatvena yathā-kramam bhagavān abravīt. ...Evaṃ yāvāt:

Sp[r]aṣṭavya<sup>78</sup>-pratibhāsā vijñaptir yataḥ sva<sup>79</sup>-bijāt pariṇāma-viśeṣ[ā-  
 prāpt]ād<sup>80</sup> utpadyate; tac ca bijam yat-pratibhāsā ca sā = te, tasyāḥ<sup>81</sup> kāya-  
 sp[r]aṣṭavyāyata[na]tvena<sup>82</sup> yathā-kramam bhagavān abravīt. Ity-ayam  
 abhiprāyaḥ.<sup>83</sup>

— *Evaṃ punar abhiprāya-vaśena deśayitvā ko guṇaḥ?*

<sup>73</sup> AKB Ch. 9, p. 466: Kṣudrake 'pi cĀgame daridra-brāhmaṇam adhikṛtyōktam: ...

Ātmāiva hy ātmano nāsti, viparītena kalpyate.

Nâstîha sattva, ātmā vā: dharmās tv ete sa-hetukāḥ ||

*The same śloka appears (with nâivēha for nâstîha ) as Asaṅga's Paramārtha-gāthā 4 (Way-  
 man 1984: 335–336).*

*According to Anacker (2005: 165), “Majjhima I, 138” – i.e. the Alagaddūpama Sutta;  
 while the passage is indeed about the anātman-doctrine, it is textually unrelated.*

<sup>74</sup> āyatanatvena **all, Tib.** *skye mched, Ch.* *bases of cognition; āyatatvena mss*

<sup>75</sup> kim **all, Vin.** *ji skad, Ch.* *what; Tib.* *'di skad du (evam)*

<sup>76</sup> rūpa-pratibhāsā **all; rūpâpratibhāsā mss a.c.**

<sup>77</sup> vijñapteś **all, Vin.** *rnam par rig pa (de)'i; om. Tib.*

<sup>78</sup> spraṣṭavya **edd, Tib.** *reg bya, Ch.* *tangible object; spaṣṭavya mss*

<sup>79</sup> sva **all; Tib.** *rang rang gi (sva-sva)*

<sup>80</sup> viśeṣa-prāptād **edd, Tib.** *bye brag tu gyur pa, Ch.* *at the effective moment; viśeṣād mss*

<sup>81</sup> tasyāḥ **mss, B, T; tasyā L, M, A, F**

<sup>82</sup> spraṣṭavyāyatanatvena **edd, Tib.** *reg bya'i skye mched du, Ch.* *as the... tangible-base;  
 spaṣṭavyāyatanatvena msc p.c., spaṣṭavyāyatatvena ms; spaṣṭavyāyata□tvena msc a.c.*

<sup>83</sup> abhiprāyaḥ **all, Tib.** *dgongs pa, Ch.* *inner meaning; a□prāyaḥ ms*

## 10. — Tathā pudgala-nairātmya-praveśo hi.

Tathā hi deśyamāne pudgala-nairātmyaṃ praviśanti. Dva[ya-ṣaṭkāḍ vijñā] na<sup>84</sup>-ṣaṭkaṃ pravartate. Na tu kaścīd eko draṣṭāsti, na ... yāvan mantēty<sup>85</sup>-evaṃ viditvā, ye pudgala-nairātmya-deśanā-vineyās, te pudgala-nairātmyaṃ praviśanti.

### Anyathā punaḥ

#### deśanā dharma-nairātmya<sup>86</sup>-praveśaḥ,

*Anyathēti* vijñapti-mātra-deśanā. Kathaṃ dharma-nairātmya-praveśaḥ? Vijñapti-mātram idaṃ rūpādi-dharma-pratibhāsam utpadyate – na tu rūpādi-lakṣaṇo dharma[ḥ kaścīd apy astī]ti<sup>87</sup> viditvā.

— *Yadi tarhi sarvathā dharmo nāsti, tad api vijñapti-mātram nāstīti!*  
*Kathaṃ tarhi vyavasthāpyate?*

— Na khalu sarvathā dharmo nāstīty-evaṃ dharma-nairātmya-praveśo bhavati, api tu<sup>88</sup>

<sup>84</sup> dvaya-ṣaṭkāḍ vijñāna **RS, Ch.** (the six) consciousnesses (develop) from six pairs of elements; dvayaṣaṭkāḍ vijñāna **mss** (unclear, only dvaṣaṭkāḍ vijñāna can be taken for granted); **Tib., Vin.** drug po gnyis las rnam par shes pa (dvābhyāṃ ṣaṭkābhyāṃ or ṣaṭka-dvayāḍ vijñāna); dvayāḍ vijñāna **edd**.

*In the Tib., the use of the Ablative seems to depend on the verb ('byung ba) that had already been selected to translate pravartate (in Kārikā 9b), therefore it is not decisive; it would also be possible to reconstruct dvayoḥ ṣaṭkayor vijñāna. For the logic of the sentence and the suggested Locative case with pravartate cf. AKB 5.25b, p. 295: dvayāt – “dvayaṃ pratītya vijñānasyōtpādaḥ” ity uktam. dvayaṃ katamat? “cakṣū, rūpāṇi” yāvat “mano, dharmā” iti. [...] sad-viṣayāt – sati viṣaye vijñānaṃ pravartate, nāstati. But this is most easily constructed as a Locative Absolute.*

*Lévi may have based his reconstruction on the Peking edition of the Tibetan Canon, where in this sentence (drug po gnyis las rnam par shes pa drug 'byung gi) the second (!) "drug" (six) is unfortunately missing. It is clearly present in all other editions consulted (i.e. Pedurma, Narthang, Derge, Cone, Ganden) as in Poussin's edition. Or Lévi may have followed Poussin's translation, where it is also missing: "la connaissance étant produite par un des six couples", de la Vallée Poussin (1912: 75).*

<sup>85</sup> mantēty **all, Ch. knower; Tib., Vin. reg pa po'i** (spraṣṭēti) – perhaps only a corruption of rig pa po'i (jñātēti)?

<sup>86</sup> dharma-nairātmya **msC, edd, Tib., Vin. chos la bdag med pa, Ch. non-substantiality of the elements; dharmmya-nairātmya msK; dhamrātmya ms**

<sup>87</sup> dharmāḥ kaścīd apy astīti **RS, Tib. chos gang yang (m)ed par, Ch. there are (no) elements; dharmmaḥ kaścīd apy astīti mss; dharmāḥ ko'py astīti edd** (this reconstruction is too short for the missing text)

<sup>88</sup> bhavati, api tu **all, Vin. yin gyi, Ch. It is not...but; bhavaṇiḥ pitu ms; Tib. 'gyur te** (bhavati)

...kalpitātmanā.<sup>89</sup>

Yo bālair dharmāṇām<sup>90</sup> svabhāvo grāhya-grāhakādīḥ<sup>91</sup> parikalpitas, tena kalpitenātmanā teṣāṃ nairātmyaṃ – na tv anabhilāpyenātmanā,<sup>92</sup> yo buddhānām viṣaya iti.

Evam vijñapti-mātrasyāpi<sup>93</sup> vijñapti-antara-parikalpitenātmanā nairātmya-praveśā[t],<sup>94</sup> vijñapti-mātra-vyavasthāpanayā sarva-dharmāṇām nairātmya<sup>95</sup>-praveśo bhavati (na tu sarvathā<sup>96</sup> tad-a[s]titvāpavādāt<sup>97</sup>). Itarathā hi, *vijñapter*<sup>98</sup> *api vijñapti-antaram arthaḥ syād* iti vijñapti-mātratvaṃ na sidhyetārthavatītvād vijñaptīnām.

— *Katham punar idam pratyetyam: “anenābhiprāyeṇa<sup>99</sup> Bhagavatā rūpādy-āyatanāstitvam uktam, na punaḥ santy eva tāni, yāni rūpādi-vijñaptīnām pratyekam viṣayī-bhavantī”ti?*

— Yasmāt

### 11. Na tad ekam, na cānekam viṣayaḥ paramāṇuśaḥ; na ca te samhatā, yasmāt paramāṇur na<sup>100</sup> sidhyati.

<sup>89</sup> kalpitātmanā *msK, msC p.c., edd, Tib. brtags pa'i bdag nyid kyis; □□tātmanā ms, msC a.c.; om. Ch.*

<sup>90</sup> bālair dharmāṇām *all, Tib. byis pa rnams kyis chos rnams kyi, Ch. of the elements... by the imagination of the ignorant; vā nairdharmāṇām msC*

<sup>91</sup> grāhya-grāhakādīḥ *all; Ch. “special characters”; Vin. gzung ba dang 'dzin pa'i mtshan nyid kyi (grāhya-grāhaka-lakṣaṇaḥ); om. Tib.*

<sup>92</sup> *Tib. adds med pa (abhāvo), Ch. is also wholly non-existent*

<sup>93</sup> vijñapti-mātrasyāpi *all, Tib. rnam par rig pa tsam yang, Ch. of this pure representation (is) also; vijñā□□□□pi ms*

<sup>94</sup> praveśāt *edd; praveśā mss; Tib. rtogs pa'i phyir (avagamāt); Vin. khong du chud pas (adhigamena)*

<sup>95</sup> sarva-dharmāṇām nairātmya *all, Vin. chos thams cad la bdag med pa; Tib. chos thams cad la chos la bdag med pa (sarva-dharmāṇām dharmā-nairātmya)*

<sup>96</sup> sarvathā *ms, B, T, Tib. rnam pa thams cad du, Ch. every kind; om. msC, L, M, A, F*

<sup>97</sup> astitvāpavādāt *edd, Tib. yod pa de la... skur pas, Ch. we deny the existence; a<sup>□</sup>titvāpavādāt ms; a<sup>□</sup>tvāpavādāt msC*

<sup>98</sup> vijñapter *all; Tib. rnam par rig pa gzhan gyi (vijñapti-antarasya)*

<sup>99</sup> anenābhiprāyeṇa *all, Tib. dgongs pa 'dis, Ch. such an inner meaning; a<sup>□</sup>enābhiprāyeṇa ms*

<sup>100</sup> *ms adds on the margin ca in a different script (or is it a careless tra?)*

iti. Kim uktaṁ bhavati? Yat tad rūpâdikam āyatanam rūpâdi-vijñaptīnām pratyekam viṣayaḥ syāt, tad ekam vā syād – yathâvayavi-rūpaṁ kalpyate vaiśeṣikaih; anekam vā paramâṇuṣaḥ; saṁhatā vā ta eva paramâṇavaḥ. Na tāvad ekam viṣayo bhavaty – avayavebhyo 'nyasyâvayavi-rūpasya kvacid apy agrahaṇāt. Nāpy anekam, paramâṇūnām<sup>101</sup> pratyekam agrahaṇāt. Nāpi te saṁhatā viṣayī-bhavanti, yasmāt paramâṇur ekam dravyam na sidhyati.

– *Katham na sidhyati?*

– Yasmāt

## 12. Ṣaṭkena yugapad<sup>102</sup> yogāt paramâṇoḥ ṣaḍ-amśatā;<sup>103</sup>

Ṣaḍbhyo dīgbyaḥ ṣaḍbhiḥ paramâṇubhir yugapad yoge sati, paramâṇoḥ ṣaḍ-amśatā<sup>104</sup> prāpnoti: ekasya yo deśas, tatrānyasyâsambhavāt.

### ṣaṅṅām samāna-deśatvāt piṇḍaḥ syād aṇu-mātrakaḥ.

Atha ya evâikasya paramâṇor deśaḥ, sa eva ṣaṅṅām. Tena sarveṣām samāna-deśatvāt<sup>105</sup> sarvaḥ piṇḍaḥ paramâṇu-mātraḥ syāt, parasparâvyatirekād;<sup>106</sup> iti na kaścit piṇḍo dṛṣyaḥ syāt.

– “*Nâiva hi paramâṇavaḥ saṁyujyante, niravaya[va]tvāt,<sup>107</sup> mā bhūd eṣa doṣa-prasaṅgaḥ!*<sup>108</sup> *Samhatās tu parasparaṁ saṁyujyanta*” iti

<sup>101</sup> paramâṇūnām *all, L*; paramâṇūnā *L*

<sup>102</sup> yugapad *all, Tib. cig car, Vin. gcig car*; yugyada *msK*; *om. Ch.*

<sup>103</sup> amśatā *edd, msK*; aṁśatā *ms*; aṅgatā *msC*

<sup>104</sup> amśatā *edd*; aṁśatām *ms*; aṅgatām *msC*. *The reading of mss is not impossible if we construe paramâṇoḥ as qualifying yoge, and the meaning is “it will have six parts” (lit. [it] reaches six-parted-ness). Tib. cha drug tu 'gyur te (ṣaḍ-amśo bhavati) would support this reading, but this is exactly the wording of the kârikâ, so probably stands for the same text (paramâṇoḥ ṣaḍ-amśatâ). Ch. “it must consist of six parts”, again matching the wording of the kârikâ, supports the reading of edd.*

<sup>105</sup> samāna-deśatvāt *all, Tib. go gcig pa'i phyir*; samādeśatvāt *msC*

<sup>106</sup> parasparâvyatirekād *ms p.c., M, F, T, Tib. phan tshun tha dad pa med pa'i phyir* (parasparâbhinnatvāt), *Ch. because [though] revolving in mutual confrontation they do not exceed that quantity*; paraspara-vyatirekād *ms a.c., msC, L, A, B*

<sup>107</sup> niravayavatvāt *all, Tib. cha shas med pa'i phyir, Ch. because they do not have spatial divisions*; niravayatvāt *ms*

<sup>108</sup> mā bhūd eṣa doṣa-prasaṅgaḥ *all, Ch. dismiss such an error as the above; Tib. nyes pa 'di 'byung du 'ong ngo zhes te (eṣa doṣa utpannaḥ syād iti) Cf. doṣa-prasaṅga in AKB (Ch. 9, p. 471), translated as: nyes par thal bar 'gyur ba.*

*Kāśmīra-vaibhāṣikās.*

— Te<sup>109</sup> idaṃ praṣṭavyāḥ:<sup>110</sup> Yaḥ paramāṇūnām saṃhāto,<sup>111</sup> na sa tebhyo 'rthāntaram; iti...

### 13. Paramāṇor asaṃyoge,<sup>112</sup> tat-saṃhāte<sup>113</sup> 'sti: kasya saḥ?

...saṃyoga, iti vartate.

**Na cānavayavatvena tat-saṃyogo<sup>114</sup> na sidhyati<sup>115</sup>.**

Atha saṃhātā<sup>116</sup> apy anyo'nyam na saṃyujyante: na tarhi *paramāṇūnām niravaya[va]tvāt<sup>117</sup> saṃyogo na sidhyatīti* vaktavyam! Sāvayavasyāpi hi<sup>118</sup> saṃhātasya<sup>119</sup> saṃyogānabhyupagamāt.

Tasmāt paramāṇur<sup>120</sup> ekaṃ dravyam na sidhyati.

Yadi ca paramāṇoḥ saṃyoga iṣyate, yadi vā nēṣyate –

<sup>109</sup> te *ms*; ta *all*

<sup>110</sup> praṣṭavyāḥ *all, Ch. we must examine; Tib. brjod par bya* (vaktavyāḥ)

<sup>111</sup> saṃhāto *ms p.c., msC, B, Vair.*; saṃhātā *ms a.c.*; saṃghāto *L, M, A, F, T*

<sup>112</sup> asaṃyoge *mss, L, M, A, B, T, Tib. sbyor ba med na*; asaṃyogāt *L<sup>c</sup>, F, Ch. Since* ([it is stated] that atoms) do not join

<sup>113</sup> saṃhāte *ms, msC a.c.*; saṃghāte *msK, msC p.c., edd*

<sup>114</sup> tat-saṃyogo *msK, msC, L, M, B, F, T, Tib. de'i sbyor, Ch. joining*; ta□ṃyogo *ms*; tat-saṃyogād *A*

<sup>115</sup> *msK a.c. adds* tat-saṃyogo na sidhyati

<sup>116</sup> saṃhātā *mss, B*; saṃghātā *L, M, A, F, T*

<sup>117</sup> niravayavatvāt *all, Tib. cha shas med pa'i phyir, Ch. because of having no spatial divisions*; niravayatvāt *ms*

<sup>118</sup> hi *all*; om. *Tib., Ch., B*

<sup>119</sup> saṃhātasya *mss*; saṃghātasya *edd*

<sup>120</sup> °abhyupagamāt. Tasmāt paramāṇur *all, Tib. khas (mi) len pa'i phyir ro. de bas na rdul phra rab, Ch. you (do not) grant... For this reason the... atom*; abhyupa□□□□ramāṇur *ms*

#### 14. Dig-bhāga-bhedo yasyāsti, tasyāikatvaṃ na yujyate.

*Anyo hi paramāṇoḥ [pūrva-dig-bhāgo 'py, anyo]<sup>121</sup> ... yāvad adho-dig<sup>122</sup>-bhāga iti dig-bhāga<sup>123</sup>-bhede sati, katham tad-ātmakasya paramāṇor ekatvaṃ yokṣyate?*

#### Chāyāvṛtī<sup>124</sup> katham vā<sup>125</sup>?

Yady ekāikasya paramāṇo[r]<sup>126</sup> dig-bhāga-bhedo na syād, ādityōdaye katham anyatra [pārśve chāyā]<sup>127</sup> bhavaty, anyatrātapah?<sup>128</sup> Na hi tasyānyaḥ pradeśo 'sti, yatrātapo na syāt. Āvaraṇam ca katham bhavati paramāṇoḥ paramāṇv-antareṇa, yadi dig-bhāga-bhedo nēṣyate? Na hi kaścit p[aramāṇoḥ]<sup>129</sup> para-bhāgo 'sti yatrāgamanād anyenānyasya pratighātaḥ syāt. Asati ca pratighāte sarveṣāṃ samāna-deśatvāt sarvaṃ<sup>130</sup> saṃhātaḥ<sup>131</sup> paramāṇu-mātraḥ syād, ity [uktaṃ purastāt].<sup>132</sup>

<sup>121</sup> pūrva-dig-bhāgo 'py anyo **RS, Tib.** shar phyogs kyi cha yang (gžhan pa nas 'og gi cha'i bar du yang) gžhan; □□□□□□ **ms**; □□□□□□ **msC**; **Ch.** the six spatial divisions; pūrva-dig-bhāgo **edd**

<sup>122</sup> dig **all**; **om. Tib.**

<sup>123</sup> iti dig-bhāga **all**; **om. ms** a.c. (added in the margin above perhaps by a different hand)

<sup>124</sup> chāyāvṛtī **all, Tib.** grib dang sgrib pa, **Ch.** shadow (n)or occultation; cchāyā-vṛtī **msK**

<sup>125</sup> vā **all**; syātām **msK** (for vā...anyo = vānyo read by the commentary); syām (?) **msK** p.c. (a later hand adds on the margin under tām of syātām: m-iti tā); **Tib., Tib.K** seems to have both syātām and anyaḥ: ji ltar 'gyur?... gong bu gžhan min (katham syātām?... piṇḍo nānyaḥ); but since katham vā is translated at other places as ji ltar 'gyur (besides once ji ltar rung), it has no weight in proving syātām to be the original reading.

<sup>126</sup> paramāṇor **all**; paramāṇo **ms**

<sup>127</sup> pārśve chāyā **RS; Tib.** ngos (gžhan) na ni grib ma 'bab pa, **Vin.** ngos (gcig) la grib ma 'bab pa (pārśve chāyā-pāto – cf. “phyi rol gyi ngos su grib ma bab pas” for Skt. apara-pārśve chāyā patantī, AKB 3.62, p. 166), **Ch.** a shadow... on the (other) side; chāyā **edd**; pā□□□ **mss**;

<sup>128</sup> anyatrātapah **all**; **om. Tib., Ch.** (and this seems to be the better reading); **Vin.** (ngos gcig la grib ma 'bab pa) gcig tu nyi ma shar bar ((ekasmin pārśve chāyā-pāta.) ekatrādityōdayaḥ)

<sup>129</sup> kaścit paramāṇoḥ **RS**; kaścitp□□□□ **ms**; kaścī□□□□ **msC**; kaścīd api paramāṇoḥ **edd**; kaścīd aṇoḥ **conj.B; Tib., Vin.** rdul phra rab gang la yang (kasyacit paramāṇoḥ); **Ch.** remaining (portion) [of the one]

<sup>130</sup> sarvaṃ **mss, L, B, T**; sarvaḥ **A, M, F, Tib.** ('dus pa) thams cad, **Ch.** all (aggregates)

<sup>131</sup> saṃhātaḥ **mss**; saṃghātaḥ **edd**

<sup>132</sup> uktaṃ purastāt **RS, Vin.** de ni sngar bshad zin to, **Ch.** as we have said above; □□□□ **ms**; a□□□□ **msC**; uktaṃ **edd, Tib.** bshad zin to

- *Kim evaṃ nēṣyate: “piṇḍasya te chāyāvṛtī, na paramāṇor” iti?*  
 — *Kim khalu paramāṇubhyo ’nyaḥ piṇḍa iṣyate, yasya te syātām?*  
 — *Nēty.*  
 — *Āha:*<sup>133</sup>

**Anyo na<sup>134</sup> piṇḍas cen, na tasya<sup>135</sup> te.**

[Yadi nā]nyaḥ<sup>136</sup> paramāṇubhyaḥ piṇḍa iṣyate,<sup>137</sup> *na te tasyēti siddham bhavati.* Saṃniveśa-[viśeṣa]-parikalpa eṣa:<sup>138</sup> “paramāṇuḥ, saṃhāta”<sup>139</sup> iti vā.<sup>140</sup>

- *Kim anayā cintayā, lakṣaṇam tu rūpā[dīnām yadi]<sup>141</sup> na pratiśidhyate?*  
 — *Kim punas teṣām lakṣaṇam?*  
 — *Cakṣur-ādi-viṣayatvaṃ nīlādityam ca.*  
 — *Tad evēdam saṃpradhāryate! Yat tac cakṣurādīnām viśayo, nīla-pīṭādikam iṣyate – kim tad ekam dravyam, a[thavā ta]d<sup>142</sup> anekam? iti.*  
 — *Kim cātaḥ?*  
 — *Anekatve doṣa uktaḥ.*<sup>143</sup>

<sup>133</sup> syātām nēty āha **all, Ch.** *Not so!, Vin.* smras pa ma yin no; **Tib.** smras pa yin no (syātām ity āha). – *Notice syātām, the reading of K, omitted in the reading of the commentary; see fn. 125 above.*

<sup>134</sup> anyo na **edd, Tib., Tib.K, Vin.** gzhān min, **Ch.** being no different; na **msK** (see fn. 125); anyonya **ms, msC**

<sup>135</sup> cen na tasya **all**; cet asya **msK** a.c. (nna added by the same hand on the margin below)

<sup>136</sup> yadi nānyaḥ **edd, Tib., Vin.** gal te ... gzhān ma yin, **Ch.** That is, if... not different; □□□nyaḥ **mss**

<sup>137</sup> iṣyate **all, Vin.** ’dod; om. **Tib., Ch.**

<sup>138</sup> saṃniveśa-viśeṣa-parikalpa eṣa **RS** (also de la Vallée Poussin’s private communication – Hamilton 1938: 53, fn. 93), **Ch.** The intelligence analyzes, arranges and distinguishes; **Tib.** yongs su rtog pa ’di ni gnas pa’i khyad par (saṃniveśa-viśeṣaḥ parikalpa eṣaḥ); **Vin.** does not quote viśeṣaḥ, but paraphrases it, giving the standard example of a wheel: dper na cha shas gnas pa ji lta bu zhig gis gnas pa’i gzugs la sogs pa ’khor lo zhes brjod kyang (yathā kenāpi bhāga-saṃniveśena rūpādi-saṃniveśas cakram ity ucyate); saṃniveśa-parikalpa eṣa **mss**; saṃniveśa-parikalpa eṣaḥ **edd**

<sup>139</sup> saṃhāta **mss**; saṃghāta **edd**

<sup>140</sup> Saṃniveśa... iti vā **RS, Ch.; Tib.** following **Vin.** construes this sentence as starting the opponent’s objection in the next paragraph.

<sup>141</sup> rūpādīnām yadi **RS, Tib., Vin.** gzugs la sogs pa’i (mtshan nyid ni ma bkag) na; rūpā□□□ **mss**; rūpādi yadi **edd, Ch.** when (you still cannot get rid of) outer colored etc. (aspect)

<sup>142</sup> athavā tad **edd**; a□□□d **mss**; **Tib., Vin.** gam, ’on te (athavā), **Ch.** or

<sup>143</sup> uktaḥ **all**; uktaṃ **F**

**15. Ekatve na kramenêtir,<sup>144</sup> yugapan na grahâgrahau,  
vicchinnâneka-vṛttiś ca, śūkṣmânīkṣā<sup>145</sup> ca no bhavet.**

Yadi yāvad avicchinnam<sup>146</sup> n[īlâdi]kam,<sup>147</sup> cakṣuṣo viṣayas, tad ekaṁ dravyam, kalpyate:

– Prthivyām kramenêtir na syād. (*Gamanam ity arthaḥ*)<sup>148</sup> Sakṛt pāda-kṣepeṇa sarvasya gatavāt.

– Arvāg-bhāgasya ca grahaṇam, para-bhāgasya câgra[haṇam]<sup>149</sup> yugapan na syāt. Na hi tasyâiva<sup>150</sup> tadānīm grahaṇam câgrahaṇam ca yuktam.

– Vicchinnâsya<sup>151</sup> cânekasya hasty-aśvâdikasy[âi]katra<sup>152</sup> vṛttir na syād. *Yatrâiva hy ekaṁ, tatrâivâparam* iti katham tayor vicche[do yujya]te?<sup>153</sup> Katham vā tad ekaṁ, yat prāptam ca tābhyām, na ca prāptam: antarāle tac-chūnya-grahaṇāt?

<sup>144</sup> kramenêtir *ms, edd, Tib., Tib.K* rim gyis 'gro ba, *Ch.* walking progressively; kramenêti *msK, msC*

<sup>145</sup> śūkṣmânīkṣā *ms, msK*; śūkṣmânīkṣā *msC, edd, Tib.* mig gis mi sod (v.l. gsod/bsod) phra ba, *Ch.* scarcely perceptible, tiny things

<sup>146</sup> yāvad avicchinnam *all, Ch.* there is no separation and difference; *Tib.* gang yin pa de ris su ma chad (yad (?) avicchinnam); yāvad vicchinnam *F, Vin.* ji snyed pa (klung dang ngam grog la sogs pas) ris su chad par ('dod de) (yāvad (nadī-śvabhra)-vicchinnam (iṣyate))

<sup>147</sup> nīlâdikam *RS, Ch.* green etc. (objects which the eye can reach) (nīlâdikaś – a possible original reading); *Tib., Vin.* (mig gi yul) sngon po dang ser po la sogs pa (nīla-pītâdikaś); nā□□kañ or nī□□kañ *ms*; nā□□kañ *msC*; nânekaṁ *edd*

<sup>148</sup> gamanam ity arthaḥ *all, Ch.* (?) there can be no reason in (walking progressively on the ground); *om. Tib., Vin.*

<sup>149</sup> câgrahaṇam *msC p.c., edd, Tib.* ma zin pa; câgra□□ *ms, msC a.c.*

<sup>150</sup> tasyâiva *all, Vin.* dngos po gcig la, *Ch.* a unitary thing; *om. Tib.*

<sup>151</sup> vicchinnâsya *ms a.c.* (or kicchinnâsya), *Vin.* (du ma) ris su chad par ('dug par) ((anekasya) vicchinnâ (vṛttiḥ)); vicchinnasya *all, Tib.* ris su chad pa (du ma), *Ch.* disconnected (things [such as] elephants)

<sup>152</sup> °syâikatra *M, F, Tib.* gcig na (similarly *Vin.* gnas gcig gi steng na (ekasmin sthāne)), *Ch.* A single place; °syânekatra *mss, L, A, B, T*

<sup>153</sup> vicchedo yujyate *RS, Tib., Vin.* ris su chad par (ji ltar) rung, *Ch.* (How) can we say that (one is) distinguished (from another?); vicche□□te *mss*; viccheda iṣyate *edd*



– Sūkṣmāṇām cōdaka<sup>154</sup>-jantūnām sthūlaiḥ samāna-rūpāṇām an-ikṣaṇām na syād. Yadi la[kṣaṇa-bhe]dād<sup>155</sup> eva dravyāntaratvaṃ kalpyate, nānyathā,<sup>156</sup> tasmād avāśyaṃ<sup>157</sup> paramāṇuśo<sup>158</sup> bhedaḥ kalpayitavyaḥ. Sa<sup>159</sup> cāiko na sidhyati! Tasyāsiddhau rūpādīnām cakṣur-ādi-viśayatva[m na sidhyatī]ti<sup>160</sup> siddham vijñapti-mātraṃ bhavati.

– “*Pramāṇa-vaśād astitvaṃ nāstitvaṃ vā nirdhāryate; sarveṣāṃ ca pr[am]āṇānām*<sup>161</sup> *pratyakṣam pramāṇam gariṣṭham*” ity. *Asaty arthe katham*<sup>162</sup> *iyam buddhir bha[va]tīdaṃ me*<sup>163</sup> *pratyakṣam iti?*

### 16. — Pratyakṣa-buddhiḥ<sup>164</sup> svapnādau yathā.

Vināpy arthenēti pūrvam eva jñāpitam.

Sā ca yadā, tadā<sup>165</sup>

na so 'rtho dṛśyate<sup>166</sup> – tasya pratyakṣatvaṃ katham mataṃ?

<sup>154</sup> cōdaka *ms*; cāudaka *all*

<sup>155</sup> lakṣaṇa-bhedād *msC p.c., edd, Tib.* mtshan nyid tha dad pa ... kyis, *Ch.* it is by characteristic aspect that (one object) differs (from another); la□□□dād *ms, msC a.c.*

<sup>156</sup> *Tib.* (following *Vin.*) understands this sentence (Yadi... nānyathā) as subordinate to the previous one (Sūkṣmāṇām... na syād), and therefore reverses their order.

<sup>157</sup> avāśyaṃ *msC p.c., edd, Tib.* nges par, *Ch.* certainly; avavaśyaṃ *ms, msC a.c.*

<sup>158</sup> paramāṇuśo *all, Ch.* becomes many atoms; *Tib.* rdul phra rab (tha dad pa) (paramāṇu-)

<sup>159</sup> sa *all, Ch.* an atom, *Vin. de; Tib.* de dag (te)

<sup>160</sup> viśayatvaṃ na sidhyatī *RS, Tib.* yul nyid du mi 'grub ste, *Ch.* sense objects... are all unprovable; viśayatvaṃ asiddham iti *msC p.c., edd; viśayatva*□□□□ti *ms, msC a.c.*

<sup>161</sup> pramāṇānām *msC p.c., edd, Tib.* tshad ma... kyī, *Ch.* Among (all) means of proof; prāṇānām *ms; prāṇāṇānām msC a.c.(?)*

<sup>162</sup> katham *all, Tib.* ji ltar, *Ch.* how; ka□m *ms*

<sup>163</sup> bhavatiḥ me *RS, Tib., Vin.* 'di ni bdag gi... 'byung, *Ch.* (such as) are now immediately evident to me; bha□□□□ *mss; bhavati edd*

<sup>164</sup> buddhiḥ *all; buddhi msK*

<sup>165</sup> tadā *all; tādā msK a.c.*

<sup>166</sup> dṛśyate *all, Ch.* Seeing (and its object are already non-)existent; *Tib.* khyod kyī ... snang (dṛśyaḥ te)

Yadā<sup>167</sup> ca sā pratyakṣa-[buddhir bhava]tīdāṃ<sup>168</sup> me pratyakṣam iti, tadā na so 'rtho dṛśyate:<sup>169</sup> mano-vijñānenāiva<sup>170</sup> paricchedāc, cakṣur-vijñānasya ca tadā niruddhatvād – iti kathāṃ tasya pratyakṣatvam iṣṭāṃ? Viśeṣeṇa tu kṣaṇika[-vādino,] yasya<sup>171</sup> tadānīm niruddham eva<sup>172</sup> tad rūpaṃ, rasādikaṃ vā.

— “*Nân-anubhūtaṃ mano-vijñānena smaryata*” ity avaśyam arthānubhavana bhavitavyaṃ; tac ca darśanam. Ity-evaṃ tad-viṣayasya rūpādeḥ pratyakṣatvaṃ<sup>173</sup> mataṃ.

— Asiddham idam anubhūtasayārthasya smaraṇaṃ bhavatīti, yasmāt

### 17. Uktam yathā tad-ābhāsā vijñaptiḥ;<sup>174</sup>

Vināpy arthena yathārthābhāsā cakṣur-vijñānādikā vijñaptir utpadyate, tathōktaṃ.

#### ...smaraṇaṃ tataḥ.

Tato hi vijñapteḥ smr̥ti-saṃprayuktā tat-pratibhāsāiva rūpādi-vikalpikā mano-vijñaptir utpadyata; iti na smr̥ty-utpādād arthānubhavaḥ sidhyati.

— *Yadi yathā svapne vijñaptir abhūtārtha-viṣayā,*<sup>175</sup> *tathā jāgrato*<sup>176</sup> *'pi syāt – tathāiva tad-abhāvaṃ lokaḥ svayam avagacchet! Na cāivaṃ bhavati, tasmān na svapna ivārthōpalabdhiḥ sarvā nirarthikā.*

<sup>167</sup> yadā *msC, edd, Tib.* gang gi tshe; yad<sup>□</sup> *ms*

<sup>168</sup> buddhir bhavatīdāṃ *M, A, B conj., F, T, Ch.* there is (this immediate) awareness, such as the color etc. (now evident to me); buddhir na bhavatīdāṃ *msC p.c., L, B; □□□□tīdāṃ ms, msC a.c.; Tib.* yul 'di nyid ni ... blo... byung ba (buddhir bhavati viṣayo 'yam eva); clearly *Tib.* yul (viṣaya) is a copyist's error for yang (ca) – *Vin.* has neither.

<sup>169</sup> dṛśyate *all, Ch.* the seeing is (already non-)existent; *Tib., Vin.* khyod kyi ... snang (dṛśyaḥ te)

<sup>170</sup> vijñānenāiva *all, Ch.* necessarily (belongs to...) consciousness; *Tib.* rnam par shes pas (vijñānena)

<sup>171</sup> kṣaṇika-vādino yasya *RS, Tib.* skad cig mar smra bas... de ltar na, *Vin.* skad cig par smra ba la... 'di ltar (perhaps ...yasmāt), *Ch.* [According to] those who hold the doctrine of momentariness; kṣaṇika□□□□yasya *ms, msC a.c.;* kṣaṇikasya viṣayasya *msC p.c., edd*

<sup>172</sup> eva *all, Tib.* ('gags) zin to, *Ch.* already; evaṃ *F*

<sup>173</sup> pratyakṣatvaṃ *all;* patyakṣatvaṃ *ms*

<sup>174</sup> vijñaptiḥ *all;* vijñapti *msK*

<sup>175</sup> abhūtārtha-viṣayā *all, Ch.* there are no true objects; *Tib.* yul yod pa ma yin pa (abhūta-viṣayā)

<sup>176</sup> jāgrato *all; Tib.* gnyid kyi ma log pa'i tshe na, *Ch.* in waking time (jāgrat-kāle)

— Idam ajñāpakam, yasmāt

**Svapna-dṛg<sup>177</sup> viṣayābhāvaṃ nāprabuddho 'vagacchati.**

Evam vitatha-vikalpābhīyāsa-vāsanā-nidrayā prasupto lokāḥ svapna ivābhūtam arthaṃ paśyann aprabuddhas<sup>178</sup> tad-abhāvaṃ yathāvan nāvagacchati. Yadā tu tat-pratipakṣa-lokōttara-nirvikalpa-jñāna-lābhāt prabuddho bhavati, tadā tat-prṣṭha-labdha-śuddha-laukika<sup>179</sup>-jñāna-saṃmukhī-bhāvād viṣayābhāvaṃ yathāvad avagacchatīti samānam etat.

— *Yadi sva-saṃtāna-pariṇāma-viśeṣād eva sattvānām artha-pratibhāsā vijñaptaya utpadyante, nārthaviśeṣāt – tadā ya eṣa pāpa-kalyāṇa-mitra-saṃparkāt sad-asad-dharma-śravaṇāc ca vijñapti-niyamaḥ sattvānām, sa katham sidhyati? Asati sad-asat<sup>180</sup>-saṃparke, tad-deśanāyām ca!*

**18. — Anyo'nyādhipatitvena vijñapti-niyamo mithaḥ.<sup>181</sup>**

Sarveṣāṃ hi sattvānām anyo'nya-vijñapti-ādhipatyena mitho vijñapter niyamo bhavati yathāyogaṃ. (*Mitha* iti parasparataḥ.) Ataḥ saṃtānāntara-vijñapti-viśeṣāt saṃtānāntare vijñapti-viśeṣa utpadyate, nārtha-viśeṣāt.

— *Yadi yathā svapne nirarthikā vijñaptir, evaṃ jāgrato 'pi syāt – kasmāt kuśalākuśala-samudācāre suptāsuptyayos tulyaṃ phalam iṣṭāniṣṭam āyatyām na bhavati?*

— Yasmāt

<sup>177</sup> svapna-dṛg *msK, ms, msC p.c., L<sup>c</sup>, M, A, F, Tib.* rmi lam mthong ba; svapne dṛg- *msC a.c., L, B, T, Ch.* (what is) seen in the dream

<sup>178</sup> paśyann aprabuddhas *RS, Tib.* mthong ste, ma sad kyi bar du, *Ch.* in the unawakened state... (all that is) seen; paśyannapravuddhas *mss*; paśyan na prabuddhas *edd*

<sup>179</sup> śuddha-laukika *all, Tib.* dag pa 'jig rten pa'i (ye shes), *Ch.* purified (knowledge) of the world; śuddhālaukika *ms p.c.*

<sup>180</sup> sad-asat *all, Tib.* (brten pa) de (tat); *Ch.* (there are neither) friends

<sup>181</sup> mithaḥ *all, Tib.* phan tshun; mitha *msK p.c.; matha msK a.c.*

**Middhenôpahataṃ<sup>182</sup> cittaṃ svapne; tenâsamaṃ<sup>183</sup> phalaṃ.**

Idam atra kāraṇaṃ, na tv artha-sadbhāvaḥ.

— *Yadi vijñapti-mātram evêdaṃ, na kasyacit kāyo 'sti, na vāk. Katham [upa-] kramyamāñānām<sup>184</sup> aurabhrikâdibhir urabhrâdīnām maraṇaṃ<sup>185</sup> bhavati? A-tat-kṛte vā tan-maraṇe katham aurabhrikâdīnām prāṇâtipâtâvadyena<sup>186</sup> yogo bhavati?*

**19. — Maraṇaṃ<sup>187</sup> para-vijñapti-viśeṣād vikriyā, yathā smṛti-lopâdikânyeṣāṃ piśācâdi-mano-vaśāt.**

Yathā hi piśācâdi-mano-vaśād anyeṣāṃ smṛti-lopa–svapna-darśana–bhūta-grahâveśa–vikārā bhavanti; ṛddhivan-mano-vaśāc ca, yathā Sāraṇasyârya-mahā-Kātyāyanâdhiṣṭhānāt svapna-darśanaṃ, āraṇyaka-rṣi-manah-pradoṣāc ca Vema[ci]triṇaḥ<sup>188</sup> parājayaḥ<sup>189</sup> – tathā para-vijñapti-viśeṣâdhipatyāt pareṣāṃ<sup>190</sup> jī[vi]têndriya<sup>191</sup>-virodhinī kācid vikriyôtpadyate, yayā sabhāga-samṛtati-vicchedâkhyam maraṇaṃ bhavatīti veditavyam.

<sup>182</sup> °ôpahataṃ *all*; °ôpahṛtaṃ *L* (in the kârikâ-only part)

<sup>183</sup> tenâsamaṃ *all*; tra nâsamaṃ *ms a.c.*

<sup>184</sup> upakramyamāñānām *M, A, F, T, Tib., Vin. gsod pa na, Ch. injured*; anukramyamāñānām *mss, L, B*

<sup>185</sup> maraṇaṃ *all*; smaranaṃ *ms a.c.*

<sup>186</sup> prāṇâtipâtâ° *all, Tib. srog gcod pa, Ch. murder*; prāṇâtighâtâ° *msC p.c.*

<sup>187</sup> maraṇaṃ *ms, msC a.c., edd, Tib. 'chi ba, Ch. The act of killing and injury (occurs)*; maraṇa *msK*; maraṇe *msC p.c.*

<sup>188</sup> vemacitriṇaḥ *B, Tib. thags zangs ris, cf. vemacitrī Vair.*; vema□□triṇaḥ *ms*; vema□□ *msC*; vemacitra- *L, M, A, F, T, Ch. King Vemacitra*

<sup>189</sup> parājayaḥ *all, cf. parājitaḥ Vair., Vin. pham; om. Tib., probably also Ch. (repeating the previous "caused... to see strange things in a dream")*

<sup>190</sup> viśeṣâdhipatyāt pareṣāṃ *all; Tib. bye brag gis sems can gzhan gyi (viśeṣât sattvântarasya), Ch. by a transformation (in one) person's representations... of another*

<sup>191</sup> jīvitêndriya *edd, Tib. srog gi dbang po, Ch. the very life*; jītêndriya *ms*; jī(vi)têndriya *msC*

## 20. Katham vā Daṇḍakāraṇya-śūnyatvam ṛṣi<sup>192</sup>-kopataḥ?

...yadi para-vijñapti-viśeṣādhipatyāt sattvānām maraṇam nēṣyate?

Mano-daṇḍasya hi mahā-sāvadyatvam sādhatatā BhagavatÔpāliḥ gr̥hapatiḥ pṛṣṭaḥ.<sup>193</sup> Kaccit te, gr̥hapate, śrutam: kena tāni Daṇḍakāraṇyāni Mātāṅgāraṇyāni Kalingāraṇyāni śūnyāni, medhyī-bhūtāni? Tenôktaḥ: Śrutam me, bho Gautama – ṛṣiṅām manaḥ-pradoṣeṇēti.<sup>194</sup>

### Mano-daṇḍo mahāvadyaḥ katham vā tena sidhyati?

Yady evam kalpyate: *tad-abhiprasannair amānuṣais tad-vāsinaḥ sattvā utsāditā, na tv ṛṣiṅām manaḥ-pradoṣān mṛtā*<sup>195</sup> ity, evam sati katham tena karmanā<sup>196</sup> *mano-daṇḍaḥ kāya-vāg-daṇḍābhyām mahāvadyatamaḥ* siddho bhavati? Tan-manaḥ-pradoṣa-mātreṇa tāvatām sattvānām maraṇāt sidhyati.

— *Yadi vijñapti-mātram evēdam, para-citta-vidaḥ kim para-cittam jānanti, atha na?*

— *Kim cātaḥ?*

— *Yadi na jānanti, katham para-citta-vido bhavanti?*

— *Atha jānanti.*

<sup>192</sup> ṛṣi *all*, *Tib.* *drang srong*, *Ch.* *rishi*; *ṛ ms a.c.*

<sup>193</sup> pṛṣṭaḥ *edd*, *Tib.* *bka' stsal pa... zhes smras pa dang*, *Ch.* *ask... saying (both suggesting an ity uktvā at the end of the question)*; pṛṣṭhaḥ *ms*; pṛṣṭha (ṣṭha) *msC*

<sup>194</sup> manaḥ-pradoṣeṇēti *all*, *Ch.* *mental rage*; *Tib., Vin.* *khros pas... ces (kopenēti)*

<sup>195</sup> mṛtā *all*; *Tib., Vin.* *dogs pa (bhītā)*, *may be a copyist's error for dgogs pa (vināsitā)*; *Ch.* *it was... merely (kṛtam)*

<sup>196</sup> karmanā *edd*, *Tib.* *las (de)s*; *karmmanā ms*; *karmanā(nā) msC*; *Ch.* *(that) [matter of the forests]*

**21. Para-citta-vidāṃ<sup>197</sup> jñānam ayathârtham.<sup>198</sup> Katham? Yathā  
sva-citta-jñānam,**

— Tad api katham ayathârtham? —

**...ajñānād<sup>199</sup> – yathā Buddhasya gocaraḥ.<sup>200</sup>**

Yathā tan nirabhilāpyenātmanā<sup>201</sup> buddhānām<sup>202</sup> gocaraḥ, tathā tad-  
ajñānāt tad ubhayaṃ na yathârtham, vitatha-pratibhāsatayā; grāhya-  
grāhaka-vikalpasyâprahīnatvāt.

Ananta-viniścaya-prabhedâgādha<sup>203</sup>-gāmbhīryāyām vijñapti-mātratāyām —

<sup>197</sup> Para-citta-vidāṃ may be an early corruption for something like Citta-mātram idaṃ. (This would give a much better philosophical sense. If there are no objects, how is perceptual error possible? Perceptual error means the disagreement of the cognition and its object.) This may have been glossed by “Yadi vijñapti-mātram evēdam”, surviving even in our commentary. A possible sequence of corruptions could be: cittamātramidaṃ → cittamidaṃ (eyeskip from ttam to tram) → cittavidāṃ (unexplained error) → para-citta-vidāṃ (a scholarly emendation restoring the metre, inspired by para-citta-vit occurring in Abhidharma-kośa 7.5b (AKB p.393), and sva-citta-jñāna here in 21c).

<sup>198</sup> ayathârtham *ms*, *msC*, *edd*, *Tib.* don bzhin ma yin, *Ch.* inexactly; ayathârtha *msK* a.c.; ayathârthaḥ *msK* p.c.

<sup>199</sup> ajñānād *all*, *Tib.* ma shes phyir, *Ch.* Because of ignorance; ajñād *msK* a.c. (nā added by a different hand in the margin above)

<sup>200</sup> yathā buddhasya gocaraḥ is extremely suspicious: it is out of context and superfluous; and of course it seems to have migrated here from the end of the next verse. Yathā is strange, the Commentary’s explanation seems forced; but it again recalls sarvathā from the last verse.

<sup>201</sup> nirabhilāpyenātmanā *all*, *Tib.* brjod du med pa’i bdag nyid du, *Ch.* ineffable object; nirabhilāṣo nātmanā *msC*

<sup>202</sup> buddhānām *all*, *Vin.* sangs rgyas... rnam kyis; *Tib.* sangs rgyas kyi (buddhasya), *Ch.* of a Buddha

<sup>203</sup> prabhedâgādha *mss*, *L*, *M*, *B*, *Tib.*, *Vin.* rab tu dbye (*Vin.* byed) ba... la gting mi dpogs (v.l. dpog), *Ch.* of kinds... diverse... difficult it is to fathom; prabhedā gādha *L*<sup>c</sup>; prabhedâ-gādha *A*; prabhedâ *F*

**22. Vijñapti-mātratā-siddhiḥ sva-śakti-sadṛśī mayā  
kṛtēyaṁ.<sup>204</sup> Sarvathā sā tu na cintyā –**

Sarva-prakārā tu sā mādṛśaiś cintayitum na śakyā,<sup>205</sup> tarkâviṣayatvāt.

*Kasya punaḥ sā sarvathā gocara?* Ity āha —

**...Buddha-gocaraḥ.<sup>206</sup>**

Buddhānām hi sā bhagavatām sarva-prakāram<sup>207</sup> gocaraḥ, sarvākāra-sarva-jñeya-jñānāvighātāt.

Iti *Viṃśatikā Vijñapti-mātratā-siddhiḥ*. Kṛtir iyam ācārya-Vasubandhoḥ.<sup>208</sup>

<sup>204</sup> kṛtēyaṁ *all, Tib.* 'di... byas, *Ch.* I... have (briefly demonstrat)ed; kṛtyēyaṁ *msK*

<sup>205</sup> śakyā *ms*; śakyate *all*

<sup>206</sup> *msK ends*: Viṃśikā Vijñapti-prakaraṇam samāptam || □ || Śloka 2iml

<sup>207</sup> sarva-prakāram *all, Vin.* rnam pa thams cad du; *om. Tib., Ch.*

<sup>208</sup> *ms ends*: Grantha-mānam asya bhāṣyasya 760ll *Below in modern devanāgarī (same hand as in msC)*: Viṃśatikā Bhāṣyam (Vijñapti-mātratā-siddhiḥ) ācārya Vasubandhu-kṛtiḥ  
*msC ends*: Grantha-mānam asya bhāṣyasya 7[1]60