

# Comparing Adult Education in the United States and Other Countries

*Alan Knox\**

*This article provides an international comparative perspective on various American adult education programs, characteristics, and combination of personal and situational influences. Fourteen brief sections based on research and practice, each contain an explanation, example, and question to encourage reader reflections about comparative analysis with adult education in other countries. The article concludes with suggested guidelines for adapting concepts from relevant sections for planning, conducting, and evaluating programs and comparative inquiry about adult education programs and influences, especially related to strategic planning.*

**Keywords:** comparative andragogy, research and practice, proposal of international comparative analysis

## *Introduction*

---

I appreciate this opportunity to share my perspectives on international comparative adult education between United States and other countries. Each of the 14 brief sections of this article illustrates an aspect of providing educational opportunities for American adults, and concludes with a question about similarities and differences between evolving features of related research and practice in the USA, and implications related to other countries of interest to you. Each section includes an explanation, example, and question about comparative analysis. The section examples reflect recent international projects in Hungary, Scotland, Canada, Turkey and Taiwan, and my 1993 *Jossey-Bass* book on strengthening adult and continuing education, based on comparative analysis of educational programs for adults in 35 countries.

## *Aspects*

---

### *Comparative*

---

Understanding similarities and differences among comparable educational programs for adults, locally and internationally, can help leaders adapt promising practices to their own setting.

The process and conclusions from international comparative adult education can facilitate global sharing and exchange. Analyzing similarities and differences across countries is parallel to comparative perspectives among diverse people and educational programs within each country. International interactions and exchanges can affect local adult education programs. Many American organizations have global connections, in which their staff members sometimes interact with people from other countries. In addition, some members participate in association activities and read publications to learn about various concepts and practices from other settings that could be adapted to their own program decisions.

International comparative adult education entails analysis of similarities and differences regarding two or more countries or regions. Each national systemic analysis of a similar program typically includes attention to context, resources, procedures, outcomes and evaluation feedback. Analysis usually includes combinations of

\* *Alan B. Knox* Professor Emeritus, University of Wisconsin, USA School of Education, 1000 Bascom Mall, Madison Wisconsin, 53706, [knox@education.wisc.edu](mailto:knox@education.wisc.edu)

personal and situational influences that contribute to adult development and organizational change. Strategic planning, futures forecasting, and trend analysis can be part of the process. If you are interested in a potential comparative project, the International Society for Comparative Adult Education (ISCAE) includes members throughout the world with interests and abilities for comparative projects. Information about ISCAE is on their website <WWW.ISCAE.org>

How widespread and beneficial are such international exchanges for adult education participants in your country?

### *Diversity*

---

The diverse scope, decentralization, and variety of words to refer to American educational programs for adults reflects separate origins regarding provider organizations, types of participants, and program purposes. With the decentralization of American adult education, this generic term includes: continuing professional education, extension, outreach, human resource development, adult education, lifelong learning, and education for the third age.

For more than a century there have been many varied part-time and short-term educational opportunities available to American adults. However, historical overviews, and handbooks every decade for more than 50 years, illustrate that there have typically been separate segments regarding: provider organization, clientele, content, publications and associations of people working in each segment.

In the United States, there are about 50 separate associations whose members coordinate and guide educational programs for adults, about half of these associations focus on a specific profession.

Fortunately, there have been some associations and publications that have spanned practice and scholarship in the entire field, in order to encourage members to learn from each other and to collaborate.

Examples of these separate segments regarding providers and clientele include: adult basic education and literacy; vocational education for adults; part-time study in higher education; training and development for people working in enterprises; adult religious education; community and neighborhood development; education regarding creativity and the arts; health education; understanding public issues; and continuing professional education.

Participation in such programs has been expanding over the years. Fifty years ago, only about 15% of the American adult population participated in one or more educational programs for adults each year. Today, the annual participation rate is more than 50%.

What is the scope, segmentation and variety of adult education in your country?

### *Adulthood*

---

Each year, most American adults intentionally engage in learning activities and in recent years about half of them participate in one or more part-time or short-term educational activities, and the extent and type of such participation varies greatly regarding topic interests, methods, uses, prior educational experience, age, and affluence. This contributes to a variety of participants in an educational activity.

Effective adult education programs are responsive to participant experience and aspirations. Understanding major features of the adult life cycle can enable adult learners, and the people who help them learn, to create responsive and challenging learning activities.

Many American adult education activities focus on improved performance. Adult performance in family, work, and community evolves over the decades with both personal and situational influences. For example, some family traditions include singing and playing music. This can encourage young people to enjoy and participate in the arts.

Responsive efforts to help adults learn build on current participant abilities; recognize and enhance participants' sense of self and aspirations for a session; help participant connections with communities of practice; and provide opportunities for participants to learn from leaders and each other.

For example, situational influences on participant performance include attention to: trends, issues, opportunities, and threats, and use of educational technology to increase access and application for progress, recognition of word-of-mouth from satisfied participants as an important source of encouragement, reduction of deterrents to participation, from multiple learning opportunities.

Effective session leaders should understand current participant proficiency as a combination of knowledge, skills and attitudes that constitute participant capability to perform effectively. To help any adult learn anything, the most valuable information is the participants' current proficiency. Participants generally have multiple learning abilities which in combination are sufficient throughout their careers to enhance progress. For example, session leaders and other stakeholders should understand that a participant's desired proficiency generally reflects past experience and perceived opportunities. Educational objectives need to be aligned, session leaders and participants can use explanations about discrepancies between learners' current and desired proficiencies to help specify educational needs. Such discrepancies tend to evolve during the career cycle, which can guide readiness to learn and change, including initiatives and innovations.

Which of these concepts about adult development and learning are familiar to people who guide effective adult education in your country?

### *Elders*

---

As in some other countries, older adults are an increasing proportion of the population, and with improving levels of education, health and well-being, more and more of them are participating in educational activities and contributing to their community.

As you know, historically, American society has been youth oriented, which reflected waves of immigrants from more traditional societies and the frontier emphasis on young people to do hard work. In recent generations, with increasing urbanization and proportions of elders who have higher levels of formal education, their rates of participation in educational activities have risen steadily. This major increase in older adults is also reflected in public policy issues related to economics, politics, health, family, and community services. Senior living centers typically include education.

For more than a generation, elders have increasingly helped lead as well as participate in educational activities, especially on non-occupational topics, such as public issues, the arts, health, travel, and community development. Increasing numbers of healthy, well educated, affluent, and dedicated elders are being recognized as valuable resources in their community.

For example, during about 12 years, a pioneering educational program to prepare older adults for community leadership has been conducted in Hartford Connecticut. A one year program provides a variety of activities regarding the community, potential projects that elders might assist, and part-time sessions each month in which participants interact with each other and guest speakers. During seminar sessions early in the year participants discover projects that interest them and other participants who become members of the team to

work together on a specific community improvement project. Later in the year, team members become familiar with a potential project, people associated with the project, and major influences on the project. During the remainder of the year, team members share with seminar participants, information about their experience with the project.

A recent external evaluation of the senior leadership seminar concluded that more than 80% of the elders who registered completed the entire seminar. Participant satisfaction was very high, and more than half of the graduates donated money for the continuation of the seminar including financial assistance toward tuition for some participants to help achieve even greater diversity. Graduates mentioned positive features such as: leadership by the director, team projects, increased familiarity with their local community, and self-confidence.

What are important similarities and differences between this pioneering American senior community leadership program in the USA, and adult education opportunities regarding elders and community leadership in your country?

### *Opportunities*

---

With decentralized provision and educational technology, American adults have available many relevant educational opportunities, depending on their awareness of programs offered by very separate organizations and on participant's time and resources to take part in them.

The totality of educational opportunities for adults in the United States reflects provision of such programs by all types of organizations. Adults study almost every topic imaginable, and may use distance education technology to do so. They are varied in age, gender, and level of formal education, but by far the highest participation rates are by people with high levels of formal education and are either young or middle-aged.

Effective adult learning activities are typically planned, conducted and evaluated to enable learners to improve their mastery and performance related to educational program objectives and content. Many types of organizations may provide educational opportunities either independently or collaboratively with other providers, such as colleges, enterprises, and associations. Participants from the helping professions may include: teachers, social workers, physicians, nurses, librarians, counselors, and professors.

Adult learners or groups of learners may guide their own learning projects, or may be assisted by prepared guidelines, or people in instructional roles who provide such guidance. Usual contributions to valuable educational opportunities include: objective setting, explaining content, encouraging practice, and providing ongoing evaluation feedback to related stakeholders.

For example, a primary care physician in a family medicine clinic might encourage various types of learning activities. One type is provision of patient education regarding prevention and promotion of wellness. A second is staff development within the clinic. The third is participation in program by a medical school. A fifth is informal learning exchanges with community groups whose members are interested in becoming and stay well.

Which of these types of educational opportunities for adults are available in your country, and which of the remainder might be promising innovations?

### *Leadership*

---

The vitality and benefits of American adult education programs reflect leadership by people who help to plan, conduct, and evaluate provider organizations and individual sessions, by attracting and retaining participants, instructors, resources, collaborators, and other stakeholders.

Desirable characteristics of adult education leaders include: familiarity with related role performance which can increase program responsiveness; understand ways to enhance participant mastery; include various combinations of part-time and full-time session leaders regarding extent and types of related experience ; and use of evaluative feedback related to session leadership which can contribute to more participant engagement and progress.

The effectiveness of session leadership can be enhanced by use of various roles and methods, such as: agreement on session objectives to guide stakeholder contributions; use of various leader perspectives and teaching styles for responsiveness to diverse participant experience and aspirations; and recruitment and retention of effective educational leaders to guide mutually beneficial exchanges.

Educational leadership also occurs in human resource development (HRD) departments of enterprises. American HRD departments vary greatly regarding extent and type of centralization of the staff development function within the enterprise, and the types of delegation within the department. Most HRD leaders are pragmatic regarding what actually works, and in best practice they seek stakeholder agreement on shared goals and encourage contributions to goal achievement. Such leaders may have formal administrative roles, or provide informal leadership on behalf of the HRD function, or maybe outside the enterprise.

In addition to internal cooperation, collaboration may occur from: consultants, labor unions, schools, universities, workforce literacy providers, professional associations, and technology organizations.

Shared leadership among multiple stakeholders includes: mutual goals, complementary contributions, and equitable benefits. This enables stakeholders to contribute to advancement of the program mission. Able leaders consider past trends, current circumstances, and desirable future directions.

The process and outcomes of excellent educational activities should entail innovation and creativity by adult participants and by people who help them learn. Ongoing evaluation feedback can contribute to program planning, improvement, and results.

What are some implications of the foregoing features of adult education leadership for leadership of adult education programs and sessions in your country?

### *Assistance*

---

The effectiveness of the people who administer and guide American adult education programs reflects the use of educational technology, professional development assistance, and guidelines from publications and associations.

Many of the people who plan and conduct American adult education programs and sessions bring relevant experience and commitment, but they lack formal preparation regarding the process of helping adults learn. Publications, associations, program evaluation, and mentors can each assist less experienced people who guide adult education programs. These sources of help can contribute the human touch which can accompany educational technology as a form of ongoing assistance. Such a combination of high tech, high touch provides a way to improve performance by people who help adults learn as well as by the participants. A promising example is computer-based simulations, especially when combined with reflection and discussion of similarities and differences between the simulation and actual performance. Local mentors can enhance the high touch by personalizing and encouraging the process of improvement. Ongoing evaluation feedback to participants, instructors and other stakeholders can contribute to positive reinforcement and encouragement, such as appreciative inquiry.

What types of assistance are used by less experienced people who help adults learn in your country?

## *Transaction*

---

The effectiveness of American adult education programs depends mainly on the vitality of the teaching/learning transactions characterized by interaction and active engagement in relevant activities that include evaluation feedback and application to improved performance.

Effective adult learning transactions provide opportunities for active learning and exchange; and able planners to select from varied methods of teaching and learning to enhance participant performance. A usual learning activity entails information seeking and problem solving.

Effective ways to sequence session activities include: attention to learning and change before, during, and following professional development sessions.

Early agreement is desirable on educational objectives, provision for practice, and evaluation feedback. Participant analysis and reflection about actual or simulated performance is especially important for continued learning and improved performance

In general, guidance of adult education sessions, and enhanced performance, and quality improvement, reflects attention to many of the following nine guidelines:

- a. Agreement by participants and other stakeholders on session objectives;
- b. Responsiveness to participant experience and expectations;
- c. Estimates of participant's current proficiencies (combinations of knowledge, skills, attitudes);
- d. Shared stakeholder aspirations for participants' improved performance and quality;
- e. Specification of the gaps between participants' current and desired proficiencies;
- f. Recognition of situational and organizational influences on sessions and related performance.;
- g. Sequencing session activities for progress;
- h. Provision of evaluation feedback to stakeholders.

What are implications of these features of guiding adult education for conducting future adult education programs in your country?

## *Entry*

---

Access and progress for American adult education activities is most difficult for adults who confront deterrents to many program opportunities, because of personal circumstances and characteristics such as low functional literacy, incarceration, disabilities, unemployment, and health problems.

An example is functional literacy. A surprising part of the American adult population is not functionally literate. This is because of rising expectations regarding the threshold of functional literacy for satisfactory performance by adults in work, family, and community roles; immigration; and some young people leaving school each year with insufficient literacy. In most communities opportunities for adults to increase their functional literacy are provided by schools and community colleges, voluntary associations, and religious institutions. Methods include tutoring for English speaking adults, group activities for immigrants, and technology use in learning centers to provide practice and assessment.

Such learning activities are typically subsidized because participants are usually unable to pay for such programs. One form of subsidy is volunteer contributions, by religious institutions and local literacy councils. Enterprises usually subsidize workplace literacy offerings. Federal and state funding helps to support such programs by schools and community colleges. Some higher education institutions encourage service learning

activities by students who volunteer, which has increased greatly during the past decade or two. Adult vocational education programs tend to include attention to enhanced literacy and career planning.

What are implications for increasing access and progress for underrepresented adults in your country?

### *Helping*

---

Practitioners and the adults who are served in relation to American helping professions (such as health, teaching, counseling) are especially engaged in learning activities to both prevent and address problems.

For example, well-being and good health is a major issue in the United States. With an aging population and related chronic illness, and disparities in access to health care, this issue is relevant to individuals, teams, organizations, and society at community, state, and national levels. Adult education activities have focused on community understanding, patient education, and reorganization for the provision of both healthcare and prevention.

Regarding public understanding and commitment about such issues, organizations such as the National Issues Forum have provided for study and action about such topics with briefing booklets, neighborhood discussion groups, and community forums to help citizens understand the topic, major influences, potential solutions, and strategies for community action. Such issues are societal and learning is both personal and local.

For healthcare providers and other organizations interested in health and wellness, one aspect is patient education. However some pioneering public health demonstration projects in various countries, such as Hearbeat Wales, have concluded that changing adult health practices requires multiple efforts aimed at: at risk patients, family members, healthcare providers, food industry practices, and mass media.

Health occupation education of students and practitioners is provided by educational institutions, enterprises where they work, and associations to which they belong. Students in nursing and medical schools engage in preceptor ships, internships, and residencies as they interact with experienced professionals, from which they both learn. There are gradually increasing arrangements for interprofessional education activities that contribute to teamwork and improved healthcare. Health coaches and computer-based education are contributing to patient education to help people assume greater responsibility for improvements in lifestyle, and wellness. Scholars and practitioners review evidence of best practice to prepare guidelines for both clinical practice and educational procedures to enhance performance.

What are implications of such features related to adult education and health for future directions regarding this aspect of adult education in your country?

### *Performance*

---

Provision and participation in American adult education activities emphasizes improved performance related to work, family, community, health, and leisure roles, so there is attention to learning and action, and a combination of personal and situational influences.

Opportunities for adults to improve their occupational performance are provided by associations, enterprises where adults work, and educational institutions. American universities and community colleges provide many types of learning activities related to work. Each type of activity may focus on individual learning using technology; or tutoring, group interaction and teamwork; or by analysis of community and societal influences. One topic of increasing importance is ways to enhance personal and group creativity and innovation.

Several distinctions are important for people who guide adult education sessions related to work. One distinction is the breadth or focus of such sessions. Another is distinctions between occupational education focused on individual learners and quality improvement focused on the organization. Another distinction is the extent of attention to participants' prior experience, current work performance, and future career directions.

Although there is less attention to adult education related to other adult life roles such as family community health and leisure, various educational opportunities are provided for each.

What are implications for educational assistance related to adult roles in your country?

### *Neighborhood*

---

A small but increasing proportion of American adult education activities are focused on intergenerational and inter-organizational efforts to improve community and neighborhood life.

And unusual example is about a very innovative neighborhood learning community in a large city neighborhood with a high number of immigrants from many other countries. Unlike many diverse urban neighborhoods that experience much conflict, more than a decade ago the Jane Addams school as established in St. Paul Minnesota to serve rapidly increasing numbers of immigrants. The director worked with people from nearby educational institutions and volunteers to begin to understand the realities that neighborhood residents were experiencing. They organized a neighborhood Council, provided transportation to enable residents to attend neighborhood activities, engaged residents in the Council to share their traditions with other people in the neighborhood. They emphasized that everyone is a learner and everyone is a teacher in this multi generational neighborhood learning community.

What are some implications from this example for adapting some of the basic concepts to community development in your country?

### *Evaluation*

---

An important but neglected aspect of American adult education is provision of ongoing evaluation feedback to program stakeholders for purposes of program planning, improvement, implementation, and impact.

For all types of educational opportunities for adults, feedback to stakeholders from ongoing program evaluation is important for planning, improvement, and accountability. Various types of inquiry can contribute to such evaluation. The evaluation focus can include personal development and organizational change. Including stakeholders in the process of planning, conducting, interpreting and reporting such evaluation can increase the likelihood that they will understand and use the conclusions.

Six concepts are particularly important for adult education program evaluation. They are: contextual influences; program scope; examples and influences on teaching and learning transactions; stakeholders help to plan, conduct, and evaluate an adult education program; program focus on participants' current and desired proficiencies to use for improving performance and benefits; and including stakeholders in the evaluation process to encourage them to use conclusions.

Evaluation conclusions can contribute to program decisions such as allocation of resources and encouraging persistence in learning activities, stakeholder contributions to planning and conducting adult education activities, and implications for role performance and interorganizational collaboration. Meta-evaluation can be used to assess the effectiveness of educational programs, evaluation procedures, and use of conclusions.



What are implications of such ongoing evaluation concepts and procedures for adult education evaluation in your country?

### *Creativity*

---

Personal creativity and organizational innovation by American adult education participants and the people who guide programs, is increasingly recognized as an important priority that can be enriched by use of relevant concepts and publications.

An autumn 2011 article on creativity and learning in the Journal of Adult and Continuing Education combined a review of scholarly writings on creativity during the past half century with my lifelong engagement in art education for adults and with writings about other forms of creativity such as in science and administration. Basic concepts of creativity related to the arts, occupational performance, and the lifelong learning process explained in the article were personal, organizational, and societal perspectives on creativity, arts, and adult education

Attention to creativity in the United States increased during the past century. Fifty years ago, scholars and teachers interested in the arts and sciences were focused on very creative achievements. Since then the scope of such interest has extended from innovative and useful outcomes such as paintings and inventions, to include characteristics of very creative people, their ways of working, and various influences. The scope has also broadened to increasingly include all people whose lifelong learning in a change and learning oriented society, have become more widespread. Creative adult education should include increased priority for creativity among adult education scholars and practitioners who conduct such programs and who can then provide adult education opportunities that enhance creativity of learners and their communities.

Fortunately there are many opportunities for American adults to become more creative. American adult education is strongly decentralized with many public and private organizations providing educational and cultural programs for adults at various levels of expertise (such as hobby courses for beginners, to master classes for able artists and musicians). Cities have many adult education programs on the arts provided by museums, universities, and regional orchestras. Adults in smaller communities in rural areas may have fewer options but community colleges, university extension, and voluntary associations provide local access and connections with additional opportunities in the state and region. Adult education for occupational creativity and innovation is even more widespread. Although occupational innovation is a small aspect of workplace learning, it is provided by public and private enterprises, by occupational associations, by higher education institutions, and by consulting firms. Much of continuing vocational or professional education is driven by technological change such as computers. A slogan for quality improvement in enterprises is that every person who works there is expected to do their job and learn how to do it better. We now recognize that people who achieve excellent occupational performance are knowledge workers who know why they perform their work as well as how, and they use concepts and guidelines for their decisions.

Progress up a career ladder entails learning and creativity in the current job to prepare for the next. There are many kinds of resistance to these trends toward creative occupational performance, but the most able adult educators and human resource development leaders, and their counterparts in other providers of vocational and professional education, provide creative arrangements. Examples include computer-based simulations and individualized coaching and mentoring to enhance creative occupational development.

In what ways can artistic and scientific innovation contribute to more creative adult education in your country?

## *Guidelines*

---

Each of the 14 foregoing aspects of American adult education briefly describes a few conclusions based on scholarship and professional practice. I hope that readers interested in international comparative adult education, have responded to some of the concluding questions regarding similarities and differences between the aspects as described for American adult education and similar aspects of adult education in one or more other countries. For one or more aspects of interest to you, note implications for your own inquiry or practice of adult education. Reflect on a promising innovation, that prompts reading, computer search, and conversations, that could lead to a plan for next steps. If you want to include international comparative adult education, identify someone from another country or context with whom you might cooperate

Following is a list of the 14 aspects to help you select one or more to pursue. As you begin to read, discuss and reflect, draft a guideline for comparative questions that you want to pursue.

1. Comparative: what few comparative concepts and methods can guide your planning or studying an innovative adult education program?
2. Diversity: what sources of program diversity warrant special focus for planning and evaluation?
3. Adulthood- to what participant characteristics should people who help adults learn be especially responsive?
4. Elders: what types of adult education concepts, topics and procedures are most likely to be beneficial and of interest to older adults?
5. Opportunities: what concepts can contribute to alignment of participant readiness to learn with awareness and access to educational opportunities?
6. Leadership: what leadership strategies are especially effective for planning and conducting adult education programs and sessions?
7. Assistance: what types of assistance (materials, communities of practice, educational technology, mentoring) might be beneficial for people who are starting to guide adult education sessions?
8. Transaction: what adult education instructional style and methods contribute especially to relevance and active engagement?
9. Entry: what program characteristics are especially important to serve and retain underserved adults?
10. Helping: what features are especially effective for continuing education of helping professionals?
11. Performance: what features of adult education programs are especially important regarding learning and improved performance?
12. Neighborhood: what strategies contribute to effectiveness regarding neighborhood and community development?
13. Evaluation: how and why should ongoing evaluation feedback contribute to adult education planning, improvement and impact?
14. Creativity: how and why should adult education programs foster creativity and innovation by program planners and participants?

## *Bibliographic essay on international comparative adult education*

---

Each of the 14 sections in this article was based on many concepts from experience, observation, and publications regarding adult education. Each section refers to multiple sources from several decades, and the

selected publications referred to major concepts in which readers of this article may be interested. The full bibliographic citations related to all sections conclude this bibliographic essay.

1. *Comparative*: For comparative analysis, it is important to include systemic aspects such as resources, process, outcomes, feedback, and context (*Havelock, 1969*). Such systemic analysis of multiple case examples was used for the study of multiple case examples from 35 countries (*Knox, 1993*). Other publications have used international case examples (*Reichsmann and Bron, 2008; Charters and Hilton, 1989*). Comparative analysis of qualitative case examples has been reported and explained (*Stake, 2010; Patton, 1997*). International handbooks have reported and analyzed comparative adult education reports (*Titmus, 1989; Aspin, 2001*).

2. *Diverse*: Decennial American handbooks on adult and continuing education, and historical reviews of the American experience with adult education, document major trends regarding diversity and decentralization of American adult education (*Kasworm, Rose, Ross-Gordon, 2010, (ed.); Stubblefield, Keane, 1994*). Some publications focus on underrepresented categories of adults and innovative ways to attract and serve them (*Kari, Skelton, 2007; Shorris, 2000; Bell, Gaventa, Peters, 1990*).

3. *Adulthood*: Many publications on adult development and learning are available. Some focus mainly on adult and continuing education (*Merriam, Caffarella, Baumgartner, 2007; Tennant, 2006; Knox, 1977; Wlodkowski, 1999*). Others include research and theory regarding adult development generally (*Birren, Schaie, 1996; Gardner, Walters, 1993; Goleman, 1995*).

4. *Elders*: Some books on social gerontology include research findings and theory regarding all aspects of adult performance (*Birren and Schaie, 1996; Bengston, 1996*). However, some publications focus specifically on older learners (*Hentschel and Eisen, 2002; Findsen and Formosa, 2011*).

5. *Opportunities*: The trends, variety and decentralization of adult education activities by American adults is portrayed in decennial handbooks (such as *Kasworm, Rose and Ross-Gordon, 2010*) and in historical analysis (such as *Stubblefield and Keane, 1994*).

6. *Leadership*: People who guide and coordinate adult and continuing education activities have many guidelines available (*Knox, 1982*). Some guidelines apply especially to professional development (*Houle, 1980*). Guidelines for organizational development can contribute to cooperation from members with various orientations toward change (*Musselwhite, 2003*). Effective strategies for program coordinators include encouraging cooperation regarding participation and resources (*Simerly, 1989, 1993; Buskey, 1981*).

7. *Assistance*: Guiding effective adult learning activities reflects some basic concepts. Included are: design of responsive educational opportunities (*Houle, 1996*), alignment of teaching and learning transactions (*Pratt, 1998*), coherent teaching style (*Heimlich and Norland, 1994*), individualized assistance (*Daloz, 2012*), and stakeholder collaboration (*Cervero and Wilson, 2006*).

8. *Transaction*: The process of helping adults learn includes cooperation by participants, instructors, and other stakeholders. There are some generic guidelines (*Caffarella, 2002; Knox, 1986*). Some guidelines apply to specific circumstances, such as: group discussion (*Brookfield and Preskill, 1999*), active workplace learning (*Silberman, 1998*), and self-directed learning (*Brockett and Hiemstra, 1991*).

9. *Entry*: The history of adult and continuing education contains many examples of provision of educational opportunities for adults who are underserved by formal educational programs (*Stubblefield and Keane, 1994*). One of many examples of such programs that encourage entry and persistence in such educational opportunities is adult basic education for American adults with low levels of functional literacy (*Quigley, 1997; Mezirow, Darkenwald and Knox, 1975*). Another example is provision of specialized general education programs

for adults from less advantaged families (*Shorris, 2000*). A third example is Highlander folk school and popular education in rural Brazil, pioneered by *Myles Horton and Paulo Freire (Bell, Gaventa and Peters, 1990)*.

10. *Helping*: Adult education for the helping professions includes both learning activities for professionals and for the people they serve. An example from the health professions included analysis of context, process, and indicators of educational quality (*Green, Grosswald, Sutter and Walthall, 1984*). An international comparative study emphasize contextual influences on illustrative programs related to health and other occupations (*Knox, 1993*).

11. *Performance*: Adult and continuing education histories and handbooks provide descriptions for many types of adult performance in family, work and community that educational activities aim to enhance (*Stubblefield and Keane, 1994; Kasworm, Rose and Ross-Gordon, 2010*). An example from the health professions that analyzes research and practice regarding the context, process and outcomes of professional development activities illustrates connections that can enhance coordination and guidance of teaching/learning transactions to improve role performance (*Davis, Barnes and Fox, 2003*).

12. *Neighborhood*: Some educational activities for adults related to citizen role may focus on community development at the neighborhood, community, or regional level. Such programs begin with residents who are concerned about a local problem or opportunity and the educational process to help them understand influences and potential solutions. One recent example is a report on such an effort in a diverse urban neighborhood (*Kari and Skelton, 2007*). Another example is focused on helping citizens in the community work together on environmental issues (*Robert, 2002*). A third example is about regional social change related to civil rights (*Bell, Gaventa and Peters, 1990*). A fourth example is on reconnecting citizens and public life (*Boyte, 2004*).

13. *Evaluation*: Various evaluation activities and conclusions can contribute to planning, improvement, and outcomes of all types of adult education activities. Some types of evaluation activities use quantitative and qualitative data to enhance understanding of the educational program and stakeholder use of conclusions. Some publications address both preparatory and continuing education evaluation (*Fitzpatrick, Sanders and Worthen, 2004*). Some focus on many types of educational programs for adults (*Knox, 2002*). Some describe detailed procedures for educational needs assessment (*Queeney, 1995*). Others provide many detailed techniques for classroom assessment (*Angelo, Cross, 1993*). Some are on quality improvement (*Brinkerhoff, 1987*). A rationale for utilization- focused evaluation emphasizes program stakeholder use of evaluation conclusions (*Patton, 1997*).

14. *Creativity*: Guidelines for enhancing creativity and innovation can focus on the process (*Feldman, Csikszentmihalyi and Gardner, 1994*), people who are cultural creatives (*Ray and Anderson, 2000*), and on adult education creativity (*Knox, 2011*).

## References

---

1. Angelo, T. and Cross, K. P. (1993): *Classroom Assessment Techniques*. (2<sup>nd</sup> Ed.) Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
2. Aspin, D. and Chapman, J. (2001, ed.): *International Handbook of Lifelong Learning*. Parts 1,2. Kluwer Academic, Boston.
3. Bell, B., Gaventa, J. and Peters, J. (1990, ed.): *We Make the Road by Walking*. Temple University Press, Philadelphia.
4. Bengston, V. (1996, ed.): *Adulthood and Aging*. Springer, New York.
5. Birren, J. and Schaie, K. W. (1996, ed.): *Handbook of the Psychology of Aging*. (4<sup>th</sup> Ed). Academic Press, Orlando, FL.
6. Boyte, H. (2004): *Everyday Politics*. University of Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia.
7. Brinkerhoff, R. (1987): *Achieving Results from Training*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
8. Brockett, R. and Hiemstra, R. (1991): *Self-direction in Adult Learning*. Routledge, New York.
9. Brookfield, S. and Preskill, S. (1999): *Discussion as a Way of Teaching*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
10. Buskey, J. (1981, ed.): Attracting External Funds for Continuing Education. *New directions for continuing education*. No. 12. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
11. Caffarella, R. (2002): *Planning Programs for Adult Learners*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
12. Cervero, R. and Wilson, A. (2006): *Working the Planning Table*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
13. Charters, A. and Hilton, R. (1989, ed): *Landmarks in International Adult Education*. Routledge, New York.
14. Daloz, L. (2012): *Mentor*. (3<sup>rd</sup> Ed). Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
15. Davis, D., Barnes, B. and Fox, R. (2003, ed.) *The Continuing Professional Development of Physicians*. AMA Press, Chicago.
16. Feldman, D. and Csikszentmihalyi, M. (1994): *Changing the World*. Praeger, New York.
17. Findsen, B., Formosa, M (2011): *Lifelong Learning in Later Life*. Sense Publishers, Rotterdam.
18. Gardner, H. (1993): *Multiple Intelligences*. Basic Books, New York.
19. Goleman, D. (1995): *Emotional Intelligence*. Bantam books, New York.
20. Green, J., Grosswald, S., Sutter, E. and Walthall, D. (1984, ed.): *Continuing Education for the Health Professions*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
21. Havelock, R. (1969): *Planning for Innovation*. Ann Arbor: CRUSK, University of Michigan, USA.
22. Heimlich, J. and Norland, E. (1994): *Developing Teaching Style in Adult Education*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
23. Hentschel, D. and Eisen, M. J. (2002): "Developing older adults as community leaders" *Adult Learning*, Vol.13, no. 4. 12-14.
24. Houle, C. (1996): *The Design of Education*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
25. Houle, C. (1980): *Continuing Learning in the Professions*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
26. Kari, N. and Skelton, N. (2007, ed.): *Voices of Hope*. Kettering Foundation Press, Dayton Ohio.

27. Kasworm, C., Rose, A. and Ross-Gordon, J. (2010, ed.): *Handbook of Adult and Continuing Education*. Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks. CA.
28. Knox, A. (1977): *Adult Development and Learning*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
29. Knox, A. (1982): *Leadership Strategies For Meeting New Challenges*. New Directions for Continuing Education, No.13. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
30. Knox, A. (1986): *Helping Adults Learn*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
31. Knox, A. (2002): *Evaluation for Continuing Education*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
32. Knox, A. (2011): Adult education creativity. *Journal of Adult and Continuing Education*, 17/ 2, autumn. 96-111.
33. Merriam, S., Caffarella, R. and Baumgartner, L. (2007): *Learning in Adulthood*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
34. Mezirow, J., Darkenwald, G. and Knox, A. (1975): *Last Gamble on Education*. Adult Education Association, Washington DC.
35. Musselwhite, C. (2003): "Managing change". In: Johnson, M., Hanna, D., Olcott, D. (2003, ed.): *Bridging the Gap*. Publishing, Madison. WI: Atwood. 55–74.
36. Patton, M. (1997, ed.): *Utilization-focused Evaluation*. (3<sup>rd</sup> Ed) Thousand Oaks, CA. Sage, USA.
37. Pratt, D. (1998): *Five Perspectives on Teaching in Adult and Higher Education*. Krieger, Malabar. USA
38. Queeney, D. (1995): *Assessing Needs in Continuing Education*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
39. Quigley, A. (1997): *Rethinking Literacy Education*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
40. Ray, P. and Anderson, S. (2000): *The Cultural Creatives*. Three Rivers Press, New York.
41. Reischmann, J. and Bron, M. (2008): *Comparative Adult Education*. Peter Lang, Frankfurt am Main.
42. Robert, K. H. (2002): *The Natural Step Story*. New Society Publishers, Ca, British Colombia.
43. Shorris, E. (2000): *Riches for the Poor*. WW Norton, New York.
44. Silberman, M. (1998): *Active Training*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
45. Simerly, R. and Associates (1989): *Handbook of Marketing for Continuing Education*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
46. Simerly, R. (1993): *Strategic Financing of Conferences, Workshops and Meetings*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
47. Stake, R. (2010): *Qualitative Research: Studying How Things Work*. Guilford Press, New York.
48. Stubblefield, H. and Keane, P. (1994): *Adult Education in the American Experience*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.
49. Tennant, M. (2006): *Psychology and Adult Learning*. (3<sup>rd</sup> Ed) Routledge, New York.
50. Titmus, C. (1989, ed.): *Lifelong Education for Adults*. Pergamon. New York.
51. Wlodkowski, R. (1999): *Enhancing Adult Motivation to Learn*. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco.